

## Minutes

### RTA Organizational, Services and Performance Monitoring Committee Meeting

9:06 a.m., November 14, 2023

**Committee Members:** Biasiotta (Chair), Koomar (Vice Chair), Sleasman, Weiss, Welch

**Other Board Members:** Love, Lucas, McPherson, Mersmann

**Not present:** None

**Staff:** Basso, Becker, Birdsong Terry, Bowles, Caver, Crawshaw, Dangelo, Davidson, Feke, Fesler, Fields, Fleig, Freilich, Garlock, Garofoli, Gautam, Gettings, Harris, Hlavacs, Johnson, Jupina, Kirkland, Macko, Marquit Renwald, Miller, Mothes, Moore, O'Donnell, Reed, Rusnov, Schipper, Scott, Sutula, Talley, Tarka, Togher, Walker-Minor, Woodford, Zimmerman

**Public:** Gibbons, Loh, Semo

The meeting was called to order at 9:06 a.m. Five (5) committee members were present.

#### RFP Procurement for Elevator and Escalator Maintenance and Repair

Dave Basso, Manager, Central Facilities and Shawn Becker, Program Contract Manager gave the presentation.

#### *Project Overview*

##### History / Background:

- RTA currently has 33 elevators, 12 escalators, and 3 platform lifts
- Equipment is located at 24 different locations – stations and buildings
- Maintained for public use through preventative maintenance (PM) program

##### Scope of services include:

- Monthly preventative maintenance on all equipment per manufacturer specifications
- 2 dedicated route mechanics Monday-Friday, 7a-3:30p
- Included at no extra labor cost
  - Mechanical defects 24/7
  - Vandalism, acts of God, etc. Monday-Friday, 7a-3:30p

##### Justification:

- Equipment sees heavy use and adverse conditions
- Equipment ensures ADA compliance at bus and rail stations
- Minimize downtime by establishing PM schedules and routine checks
  - Remote monitoring on all equipment at no cost that can be accessed via web or phone app

#### *Procurement Overview*

The RFP was issued on July 9, 2023. It was accessed on the GCRTA website by seven interested parties. Proposals were due September 14, 2023. Four firms proposed. A 0% DBE goal was assigned to this procurement. The evaluation panel consisted of several RTA departments using select criteria.

Recommended Firm:

- Schindler Elevator Corporation
  - Founded in 1874, with 149 years of experience
  - Over 1,000 branch offices in 100+ countries
  - Over 66,000 employees
  - No. 1 Supplier of both escalators and low- and high-rise elevators
  - No. 1 OSHA Industry Safety Rating for last 3 years
  - First and only elevator company to be ISO Certified

Firm's Experience:

- Local Cleveland Office
  - Employ approximately 80 mechanics in Local 17
  - Experience serving large agencies with similar requirements
- Center for Service Excellence – Holland, OH
  - National Service Headquarters
    - 24/7 Customer Contact Center
  - National Parts Warehouse with 40,000 + part numbers with overnight shipping
  - National Field Engineering Team
    - Provide virtual support to local mechanics
    - Circuit board printing and repair
    - Reverse engineering of competitor equipment
- Training center

Client Base includes:

- Cleveland Guardians, Landmark Office Building (Sherwin-Williams), Summa Health, University Hospitals Main Campus, Cleveland Hopkins Airport, The Cleveland Clinic, 200 Public Square, and University of Akron, among others

Staff requests that the Organizational, Services and Performance Monitoring Committee recommend to the Board of Trustees the award for elevator and escalator maintenance and repair services to Schindler Elevator Corporation in an amount NTE \$2,980,356.00 for the three-year base period, with two one-year options NTE \$1,049,891.00 and \$1,077,427.00 respectively, for a total contract amount NTE \$5,107,674.00 for the five-year period. This total amount is approximately 13.5% below the project estimate.

Mayor Biasiotta asked for the year-over-year increase and how this new contract will improve reliability. The current contract is heavily preventative maintenance based. The current monthly rate is \$76,000. The price decreased to \$70,000/mo. They anticipate it going up to over \$80,000/mo. This contractor has over 80 mechanics locally with over 16 routes that overlap RTA's routes. They have access to a local warehouse near the airport, a higher capacity and parts in their national facility in Holland, OH. They have four on-call mechanics during off hours. The other companies have two.

Mr. Sleasman asked if there are performance expectations and if the previous contract met those expectations. The contract includes response times and uptimes. The previous contractor met some, but not all expectations. It was moved by Mayor Biasiotta, seconded by Mr. Sleasman. The chair asked for a roll call. There were five (5) ayes and none opposed.

City of Shaker Heights Maintenance Agreement

Jim Reed, Property Manager gave the presentation. This agreement is for labor and materials for all landscape maintenance on the Authority's Blue Line and Green Line right a way in the City of Shaker Heights. The services include all landscaping, labor and materials including snow removal at the

Authority's rail station parking lots in Shaker Heights. In the 1975 Mass Transit Agreement, Shaker Heights reserved the right to perform landscaping and snow removal services. The Authority agreed to compensate Shaker Heights for labor and material cost pursuant to a fixed schedule of services. By agreement dated November 23, 1982, the Authority and Shaker Heights agreed to delineate the respective responsibilities for maintenance on the grounds and facilities constituting the Shaker Rapid system. There followed a series of 3-year agreements.

The current agreement from 2021 through 2023, expires December 31, 2023. The agreement is for a one-year period. It is for one year because Shaker is currently negotiating a collective bargaining agreement which will establish its labor cost for 2025 and beyond. So those costs are yet to be determined. Cost for 2024 are known. The schedule will return to its triennial schedule in 2025. The cost is \$290,735.52 or 2% lower than the 2023 expense.

Recommendation:

- Staff requests that the Organizational, Services and Performance Monitoring Committee recommend to the Board of Trustees the agreement with the City of Shaker Heights for the provision of labor and materials for all landscape maintenance for a one-year term at a cost of \$290,735.52.

It was moved by Mayor Biasiotta, seconded by Mayor Koomar. The roll was called. There were four (4) ayes and one abstention from Mayor Weiss.

The meeting was adjourned at 9:21 a.m.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Rajan D. Gautam  
Secretary/Treasurer

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Theresa A. Burrage  
Executive Assistant

