

Minutes

RTA Board of Trustees Meeting
9:02 a.m., January 15, 2019

Board Members: Clough (Chair), Lucas (Vice Chair), Bibb, McCall, Moss, Serrano and Welo.

Not present: Elkins, Joyce

Also Present: Abrams, Adams, Anderson, Baker, Benford, Bitto, Bobich, Burney, Butts, Calabrese, Castelucci, Catalusci, Caver, Cottrell, Cranford, Czeck, Dangelo, Davis, Draper, Eaton, Feliciano, Ferraro, Fields, Fini, Ford, Garofoli, Gautam, Gillan-Shafron, Heman, Johnson (E), Johnson (L), Jones, Keshtkaran, Kirk, Kirkland, Lamb, Lewis, Loh, Manus, McDermott, McGrady, Montgomery, Moore, Pickett, Prendergast, Schaefer, Schipper, Shariff, Stover, Sutula, Togher, Vukmanic, Wiehi, Winn, Young, Zeller

Mayor Clough called the meeting to order at 9:02 a.m. The secretary called the roll and reported that seven (7) board members were present.

The Secretary advised that notice of this meeting has been posted more than twenty-four hours in advance of the meeting, that the usual notification has been given the news media and other interested persons, and that all requirements of the Ohio Revised Code and Rules and Bylaws of this Board regarding notice of meeting have been complied with.

Minutes

Mayor Clough stated that the minutes from the December 18, 2018 Board Meeting minutes had been previously distributed and reviewed and asked whether there were any additions and/or corrections. There were no changes. The minutes were approved.

Invitation for public comment on agenda matters – (2 minutes)

1. Rev. Pamela M. Pinkney-Butts – She asked that staff look at the amount of money being spent to repair doors and elevators. The doors in Tower City is always in need of repair. The elevator at Louis Stokes Station is not working. She knows people that will contract with RTA for Paratransit service in reference to Reso Nos. 7 and 8. She knows people who can partner with RTA on apartment complexes in reference to Reso No. 9. She requested better staff communication with operators.

Committee reports

Operational Planning & Infrastructure Committee report – Chair: Mayor Georgine Welo

- Reso Nos. 7 and 8 went through this committee. In conjunction with working with Rev. Lucas, the request is for a four month extension to allow for an increase to the current paratransit contracts. This will enable staff to award new contracts in February. The extension will enable more national firms to bid on the work, to improve service and allow for the transition period. The money is included in the budget.

External and Stakeholder Relations and Advocacy Committee report – Chair: Valarie J. McCall

- This committee will meet Feb. 19 on the System Design. She will meet with Dr. Caver to align the committee meetings for the quarter for the five (5) pillar studies. This committee will have a lot of dialogue with the public.

Mr. Serrano asked what would happen if a national firm gets the Paratransit contract and outsources their work to the current vendors. How would this change the quality of work? Melinda Dangelo said the current proposers are being interviewed. They have identified their subcontractors. The panel does due diligence to ensure they adhere to RTA requirements. The RFP was revised to require additional services and enhancements to the current program. If any of the current contractors propose, they would have to respond to the new requirements. The new contracts will require additional monitoring. The process will be managed.

Ad Hoc CEO Search Committee report – Chair: Karen Gabriel Moss

- The contract with the CEO search firm has been signed. She is working with the vendor on getting the proposal circulated. There will be an update soon. The process will be transparent.

Audit, Safety Compliance and Real Estate report – Chair: Karen Gabriel Moss

- Tony Garofoli, Internal Audit Executive Director requested suggestions from the Board on audits for 2019. He can meet individually or take calls. There was a lot of interest in the W. 25th Street project. The Board requested a more in-depth presentation.

Organizational, Services & Performance Management Committee report – Chair: Rev. Charles P. Lucas

- The contract for ultra-low sulfur diesel fuel is on the agenda.

Ad Hoc Bylaws Review Committee report – Chair: Mayor Georgine Welo

- This committee has been meeting since last July. The Board looked at their leadership a few years ago and implemented a new committee structure. The plan is to bring the revised Bylaws to the Board in April/May. They discussed breaking out the section in the bylaws that describes the Secretary-Treasurer and CEO, General Manager positions in Article II, Section 1 and 8. Now that the search firm is in place, this needed to be brought to the Board. She requested the Board Chair call a Committee of the Whole meeting to review a draft of the revised sections and resolution. Mayor Clough confirmed the meeting for February.

Nominating Committee – Mayor Clough

- Last year a process was set up to nominate the officers of the Board. Board members interested in serving on this committee should contact Mayor Clough. The new officers will be elected at the Annual Meeting in March. Board members who want to run for office should not serve on the committee.

Introduction of New Employees/Promotions

They will be presented next month.

Community Advisory Committee (CAC)

Mr. Bibb met with Jose Feliciano, Jr. to review the existing 10 applicants. They will bring them to the Board for approval. He will host a meet & greet lunch with CAC members on Feb. 14. He and Jose is working on a strategy on best ways the CAC can be engaged in all the major pillar studies. Mr. Bibb is working with the CAC of the NOACA Board. He has a new position as the Vice President of Corporate Strategy at KeyBank. Chief McCall was just elected president of NOACA.

Introduction of resolutions

- A. 2019-1 – Expressing congratulations to the employees of the Greater Cleveland Regional Transit Authority who retired during the fourth quarter of 2018, the adoption of which was moved by Mr. Serrano, seconded by Mayor Welo and approved by unanimous vote.

Cathy Eaton, Hayden District Director, with 38 years of experience, thanked everyone for her time at RTA. She introduced several members of her former team at Hayden and her family members. Mayor Clough, Chief McCall and Dr. Caver congratulated her.

- B. 2019-2 – Authorizing Contract No. 2018-124 with Ports Petroleum Co. Inc., for the furnishing of approximately 7,245,000 gallons of ultra low sulfur diesel fuel, as specified and as required, for a period of three years, at a price of minus \$.0307/gallon below OPIS index for year 1, minus \$.0328/gallon below OPIS index for year 2, and minus \$.0281/gallon below OPIS index for year 3 (General Fund, Fleet Management Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Mr. Serrano, seconded by Mr. Bibb and approved by unanimous vote.
- C. 2019-3 – Authorizing Contract No. 2018-130 with the Aftermarket Parts Company, LLC for the furnishing of 220, 200K Predictive Maintenance Kits, as specified and as required, for a period of two years in an amount not to exceed \$323,785.00 (General Fund, Fleet Management Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Ms. Moss, seconded by Chief McCall and approved by unanimous vote.
- D. 2019-4 – Authorizing Contract No. 2018-135 with Hans Truck and Trailer Repair, Inc., to furnish up to 60 Caterpillar C-9 Diesel Engine Particulate Filters, as specified and as required, for a period of two years, in an amount not to exceed \$468,360.00 (General Fund, Fleet Management Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Ms. Moss, seconded by Mr. Serrano and approved by unanimous vote.

These filters are on the caterpillar engines. They are used to clean sulfur out of the diesel. The price is due to the precious metals, like titanium inside them.

- E. 2019-5 – Authorizing Contract No. 2018-138 with Standard Contracting & Engineering, Inc. for Project 17.72 – CBFM 3-Post Lift & Fall Protection System, as specified and as required, in an amount not to exceed \$280,867.00 (RTA Development Fund, Engineering & Project Development Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Ms. Moss, seconded by Mr. Serrano and approved by unanimous vote.
- F. 2019-6 – Authorizing Contract No. 2018-141 with Schirmer Construction LLC for Project 18.01 – CBFM Smoke Hatches Replacement, for a total amount of \$168,000.00 (RTA Capital Fund, Engineering & Project Development Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Ms. Moss, seconded by Mayor Welo and approved by unanimous vote.
- G. 2019-7 – Authorizing a four-month extension to Contract 2013-112A with Future Age, Inc., DBA Provide A Ride, for Supplemental Paratransit Services, in an amount not to exceed \$1,584,727.60 for a total contract amount not to exceed \$23,388,957.60 (General Fund, Paratransit Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Rev. Lucas, seconded by Mayor Welo, and approved by unanimous vote.

Rev. Lucas said that for agenda items G and H, there will be conversations with contractors about the service concerns and their compliance with the new contract. Mayor Welo said they have worked with administration on the standards and goals. Mayor Clough added that the intent for this change is to have more vendors bid on this work so that the contracts can expire at the same time with the plan to meet the new guidelines.

- H. 2019-8 – Authorizing a four-month extension to contract 2015-046 with Lakefront Lines, Inc. for Supplemental Paratransit Services, in an amount not to exceed \$1,088,850.12, for a total contract amount not to exceed \$11,085,909.12 (General Fund, Paratransit Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Rev. Lucas, seconded by Mayor Welo and approved by unanimous vote.
- I. 2019-9 – Authorizing the Interim CEO, General Manager/Secretary-Treasurer to grant to the Board of Park Commissioners of the Cleveland Metropolitan Park District (“Metroparks”) a Project Development Agreement and Perpetual Shared and Non-shared Trail Easements for the purposes of access, ingress and egress and for constructing, installing, maintaining, operating, and replacing or removing a multi-purpose trail known as the Red Line Greenway across certain portions of Greater Cleveland Regional Transit Authority (“GCRTA”) property, the adoption of which was moved by Ms. Moss, seconded by Mr. Bibb. Chief McCall requested a roll call. There were six (6) ayes and one (1) recuse by Chief McCall. It was approved.

The Board was shown several designs of the Red Line Greenway. The Greenway is a vital part of RTA’s strategy for that area. This agreement will allow the Metroparks to continue with their TIGER grant to develop the area. Mr. Bibb toured the area. He applauded the project. He believes this can be a catalyst for the City of Cleveland and the regional and RTA to encourage TOD. Mayor Welo applauded the partnership with the Metroparks.

- J. 2019-10 – Authorizing the Authority to enter into a Transit-Oriented Development Fare Agreement with Aspen Place Apartments L.P., the adoption of which was moved by Mr. Serrano, seconded by Mayor Welo and approved by unanimous vote.

This is a TOD project. The land at W. 25 Street Station was sold to Aspen Place. They will offer their residents a bus pass included in their rent payment. Ms. Moss is concerned that the 60% discount will become a pattern with other organizations. There are other housing developments in the community that serve the same economic group of people. Will this be affordable for RTA to offer this to other developments, and if not, why is this project being favored. Dr. Caver said the staff will present a policy and resolution to bring some order around TOD projects and defining levels that will give management ranges for negotiations. It will likely be based on the size of the building or unit. This policy/resolution will be brought to the Board by the end of the first quarter. Chief asked that the policy explains how discounts are determined for corporations and to look at how passes are offered to residents who may or may not use the passes. Rajan said they will look at the concerns.

Interim General Manager/Secretary-Treasurer’s Report

Sales Tax for Jan. 2019 was \$17.3 million or 12.8% higher than Jan. 2018 and 9.5% higher than estimate and \$1.5 million more than expected for the month. EOY 2018 actual revenue was \$6.5 million above budget and \$3 million above the 3rd quarter estimate. Even though ridership declined,

2018 passenger fares revenue was up \$1.2 million over 2017. December ridership was down 2%. The gap has decreased from the beginning of 2018 at 9% decreases and 2% decreases in December. YTD is 5%. In 2018, ridership was down 5%. Bus was down in Dec. 1%. YTD it was down 4%. Average weekday ridership for Dec. 2018 in comparison to Dec. 2017 decreased, but weekend ridership increased.

The east entrance for the E. 105th Street Station should open later this month. The E. 116th Street Station work is progressing with a soft opening planned for Feb. 2018. The Farnsleigh Station on the Blue Line is awaiting solar shelters, but 80% of the work is done. The Customer Service center at Tower Center is being reconstructed. The existing space will be expanded. A temporary station will be built on the eastbound side of the Red Line. There are no scheduled rail shutdowns for the next week. There could be a potential shutdown at the end of January. The next Quarterly Service Planning Open House will be held Feb. 27 or March 5. This will be after Jarrett Walker & Associates has met with local planners related to the system redesign study.

RTA was awarded a \$1.6 million DERG grant. It will provide 67% of the cost for five CNG buses, replacing 2003 diesel buses. An opportunity to apply for a \$3 million grant from the EPA will be provided in future update. December mobile ticketing sales was \$388,000. Sixty-five thousand passes were sold. Gross sales for 2018 was \$4.5 million. The spring service change begins March 10. There will only be minor changes. Beginning in March, the #1 St. Clair route will extend to the Amazon Facility in Euclid. The facility created 900 jobs. Amazon partnered with RTA to allow service on their property. RTA also provides service to their facility in Warrensville Heights.

The TEAM goal was met for preventable accidents and OJIs. Preventable accidents is 1.31 which is below the goal of 1.4. OJI's is 8.4 per 200,000 compared to the goal of 9.5. Miles between service interruptions is 12,400, below the 15,000 goal. The on-time performance goal of 80% was reached. Ridership is down as explained earlier. Ride Happy Ride Free which measures customer satisfaction is one request per 29,000, which is below the goal of one request for 30,000. Attendance is 5.84% which is just above the 5.0% goal. RTA is the 17th largest employer in Cuyahoga County. RTA is listed between LTV Steel and Lincoln Electric. Excluding the state and federal government, RTA is the 5th largest government entity in the county. RTA employees raised \$105,839.32 for its Employee Giving Campaign last quarter. The campaign supports EarthShares, United Way, Community Shares, UNCF and Harvest for Hunger.

Mr. Serrano asked how the government shutdown will affect RTA's ability to apply for federal grants. Dr. Caver said the Triennial deadline will be pushed back because the FTA is not working. If the shutdown continues, reimbursement will be delayed. Staff is looking at how to handle major issues if the government doesn't open up. The positive side is that this is a slow construction season. Chief McCall asked if the drop in ridership on the HealthLine and CSU Line is a result of the operators verifying the fares. Dr. Caver said the fare payment change on the HL showed that more revenue was collected, with less customers. That means that more riders were riding free. The estimate given the prior year shows \$500,000 more in cash even though there is a 15% decline in ridership.

President's Report

Joe Calabrese received the Walter F. Ehrnfelt, Jr. Award for his commitment and dedication to the NOACA Board and his contribution to the region.

Questions or comments from the audience (2 minutes)

1. George Zeller – Cleveland, OH – The sales tax for the month was favorable. It was up 13% over last year and 9% above the estimate. But it was down when you look at the 12 month

moving average and adjusted for inflation. Last month it was down by 6%. This month it was down by 4%. It's been 19 months in a row where it's been down. It peaked back in 2001. It's down \$2.4 million on a monthly bases, which is \$29.5 million a year.

2. Mary Ellen Hemann – North Olmsted, OH – She is the Ward 4 Councilwoman in North Olmsted. She commended the operators and the Park-N-Ride facility in her ward. But the landscaping behind the Park-N-Ride is not being maintained. The contractor's chemical usage has caused trees behind the facility and in resident yards have died. She requested the contractors are told what they are responsibility for. Dr. Caver said he would meet with her after the meeting. Chief McCall requested staff look into the chemical issue.
3. Terry McGrady – Cleveland, OH – He is the ATU executive board member for Triskett. Aflac has an agreement with ATU and RTA that is causing a hardship for them. Mayor Clough recommended this be discussed with George Fields and Scott Ferraro in Human Resources. Terry wanted to make sure the Board is updated on the issue. They have had issues with the administration. Mayor Clough asked Dr. Caver to update them. The union president has engaged with management in writing and they will respond. Terry said that issues are not always brought to them in a timely fashion, which inconveniences the employees. Terry objected to having two minutes to speak.

Mr. McGrady said the Board should provide oversight. Mayor Clough said he'd be happy to meet with him to discuss further.

4. Marques Manus – Cleveland, OH – A woman overdosed on Dec. 17 on the HealthLine. The response time was good. He asked if the cameras could see the incident. Dr. Caver confirmed that the camera can see the entire bus. Marques requested the emergency policy. The general response to an emergency is that the operator contacts the ICC and they will contact the appropriate authority.
5. Lenny Stover – Cleveland, OH – He thanked the Board for approving the easement for the Red Line Greenway. The renderings displayed at the meeting were done under the direction of the Rotary Club. They've had over 700 volunteer visitors to the site. He requested the Board not develop the land on Columbus Road between Abbey and W. 25th. He quoted Cleveland City Councilman McCormack speaking about the economic, environmental benefits of trees in urban areas in response to trees being trimmed. Staff from the Museum of Natural History has helped to preserve over 10,000 acres in NE Ohio. The land was determined to be a wetland. Several organizations and community members have objected to this development.
6. Ken Prendergast – Lakewood, OH – He is the Executive Director of All Aboard Ohio. All Aboard has been around for 45 years. They have 500 members and 5,000 followers on social media. There is potential for new state funding as a result of a statewide coalition and a more transit supportive ODOT director. They are watching projects that affect transit like safety issues, system redesign, State of Good Repair, new rail cars, lakefront multi-modal transit center, TOD and new revenues and expansion to link jobs and job seekers. According to the Bureau of Labor Statistics, job growth in greater Cleveland is growing twice the national average.
7. James Lamb – Cleveland, OH – He opposes service being extended to benefit a business, when he has lost service on the 81. He's had to pay extra money to ride the bus because he didn't have change. He asked what happens to the extra fare. The Board just started reviewing the Bylaws after 17 years. RTA takes away from those who don't have enough.

8. Loh – Cleveland, OH – The Board needs to lead the employees and can't expect to only hear good information. The public will support the Board if they work to reverse the bad things going on. Riders believe the worse part of RTA is customer service. She hopes this will improve with the current studies. The discount for Aspen Place residents should be offered to all low income housing. Students shouldn't be penalized for forgetting their fare cards.

9. Shirley Schaefer – Cleveland Hts, OH – The operators tend to pass up customers. The E-Line trolley passed her up on the way to this meeting. She ended up walking to this meeting. There needs to be more training. Mayor Clough directed her to Joel Freilich, Director of Service Management.

The next regular Board Meeting is scheduled for Tuesday, February 19, 2019, in the Board Room of the Authority, Root-McBride Building, 1240 West Sixth Street, Cleveland, Ohio 44113.

This meeting was adjourned at 10:32 a.m.



President

Attest: 

Interim CEO, General Manager/Secretary-Treasurer