

Minutes

RTA Board of Trustees
9:04 a.m., February 20, 2018

Present: Dixon (Chair), Clough, Elkins, Lucas, Nardi, Norton, Serrano, Welo

Not present: McCall, Moss

Also Present: Albro, Anderson, Benford, Benner, Biggar, Bitto, Brooks-Williams, Brown, Burney, Calabrese, Campbell, Catalusci, Caver, Cranford, Czeck, Damanti, Dangelo, Davis, Draper, Ferraro, Garofoli, Gautam, Gray, Hambro, Harrison, Jaszczak, Johnson, Joyce, Kirkland, Krecic, Laule, Loh, Montgomery, Pickett, Pierce, Pinkney-Butts, Prease, Raguz, Ranaldson, Raphael, Schipper, Scott, Shariff, Sims, Singh, Solomon, Srinivasan, Taino, Tarter, Townes, Vukmanic, White, Wiehe, Winn, Woeltel, Worley-Bell, Young, Zeller

Mr. Dixon called the meeting to order at 9:04 a.m. The secretary called the roll and reported that eight (8) committee members were present.

The Secretary advised that notice of this meeting has been posted more than twenty-four hours in advance of the meeting, that the usual notification has been given the news media and other interested persons, and that all requirements of the Ohio Revised Code and Rules and Bylaws of this Board regarding notice of meeting have been complied with.

Mr. Dixon stated that the minutes from the November 21, 2017 Board meeting and January 16, 2018 Board meeting had been previously distributed and reviewed and asked whether there were any additions and/or corrections. William Tarter of Clevelanders for Public Transit stated that his name was spelled incorrectly. The correction was noted. Mayor Clough and Mr. Nardi abstained from voting on the Nov. 21, 2017 minutes.

Invitation for public comment on agenda matters – (2 minutes)

1. Mr. George Zeller – Cleveland, OH – Resolutions B-F have policy implications. There is a proposal on the table to have the CAB meet quarterly. The policy has already been implemented. They have not met for several months. There is a large amount of issues that need close attention. He is against meeting quarterly versus monthly, especially in times of urgency. They will not have recommendations if they meet quarterly. Mr. Serrano said the policy is on paper, but is not in stone. The standing committees can still meet monthly. The committee is required to meet at least quarterly, but can meet more often if need be. The next meeting is in March.
2. Rev. Pamela M. Pinkney-Butts – Cleveland, OH – She congratulated the CAB members being honored today. She requested to be on the CAB. She opposes Reso. No. 2018-23 thru 25. She believes too much money is being spent on law enforcement and racial profiling. Vehicles and resources are being lost in time being spent preparing for battle and war. People used to get passes once they got out of jail. Look into how much money is being spent on transit police equipment versus what needs to be done in the community. She wants to know what happened to the State's Rainy Day funds for public transit.

Committee reports

There were no reports.

Introduction of New Employees/Promotions

Venkataraman Srinivasan is the new database administrator. He has 20 years' experience working with Oracle. He is married and lives in Solon with this wife and children. He received his bachelor's degree in math and business in India. Michael Damanti was promoted to security systems specialist. He's worked

here for a few months now. Nick Biggar was promoted to Hayden District Director. He's acted in the position for a year and has been at RTA for seven years. Mayor Clough presented a 25-year service pin to George Dixon.

Citizens' Advisory Board

There was no report.

Introduction of resolutions

- A. 2018-10 – Expressing congratulations to Marisol Simón upon her retirement from the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) and extending best wishes for her future endeavors, the adoption of which was moved by Rev. Lucas, seconded by Mayor Welo and approved by unanimous vote.

Marisol has been a wonderful partner with RTA. She started on the rail crew in New York City. He will present the resolution to her later this month at the FTA quarterly meeting in D.C.

- B. 2018-11 – Expressing appreciation to Steve Albro for his longstanding service and dedication to the Citizens Advisory Board and the Greater Cleveland Regional Transit Authority and for being a tireless advocate for public transportation, the adoption of which was moved by Mayor Welo, seconded by Mayor Clough and approved by unanimous vote.
- C. 2018-12 – Expressing appreciation to Marie Fratus for her longstanding service and dedication to the Citizens Advisory Board and the Greater Cleveland Regional Transit Authority and for being a tireless advocate for public transportation, the adoption of which was moved by Mayor Clough, seconded by Mr. Nardi and approved by unanimous vote.
- D. 2018-13 – Expressing appreciation to Donna Prease for her longstanding service and dedication to the Citizens Advisory Board and the Greater Cleveland Regional Transit Authority and for being a tireless advocate for public transportation, the adoption of which was moved by Rev. Lucas, seconded by Mr. Serrano and approved by unanimous vote.
- E. 2018-14 – Expressing appreciation to Andre White for his longstanding service and dedication to the Citizens Advisory Board and the Greater Cleveland Regional Transit Authority and for being a tireless advocate for public transportation, the adoption of which was moved by Mr. Serrano, seconded by Mayor Welo and approved by unanimous vote.
- F. 2018-15 – Expressing appreciation to George Zeller for his longstanding service and dedication to the Citizens Advisory Board and the Greater Cleveland Regional Transit Authority and for being a tireless advocate for public transportation, the adoption of which was moved by Mayor Welo, seconded by Mayor Elkins and approved by unanimous vote.

Leo called up each CAB member receiving resolutions. They are not retiring, but receiving emeritus status. Marie could not be here today. They will receive a lifetime pass to RTA. Some have served on the CAB since its inception. They will continue to serve on the CAB, but new members will be added to the Board. George congratulated them on their service.

- G. 2018-16 – Authorizing Contract No. 2017-147 with SimplexGrinnell, LLP to provide fire and safety inspection and testing through the State of Ohio, Department of Administrative Services, Cooperative Purchasing Program, as required, for a period of one year in an amount not to exceed \$125,838.80 and in an amount not to exceed \$125,838.80 for one option year, for a total contract amount not to exceed \$251,677.60 (General Fund, Asset and Configuration Management Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Mr. Serrano, seconded by Mayor Clough and approved by unanimous vote.
- H. 2018-17 – Authorizing Contract No. 2017-157 with KS Associates, Inc. for project 17.60 – On-Call Surveying Services Phase 5 in an amount not to exceed \$250,000.00 for a period of 36 months (RTA Capital and/or RTA Development Funds, Engineering & Project Development Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Mayor Welo, seconded by Mayor Clough and approved by unanimous vote.

Mayor Welo reported that this went through her committee. She learned this contract provides assistance to RTA surveyors for various jobs. Mr. Dixon thanked her for her additional input.

- I. 2018-18 – Authorizing Contract No. 2017-159 with Sherwin Williams for the furnishing of LRV spray in place floor and roof material, as specified and as required, in an amount not to exceed \$170,203.86 (RTA Development Fund, Rail District Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Mr. Serrano, seconded by Mayor Clough and approved by unanimous vote.
- J. 2018-19 – Authorizing Contract No. 2017-162 with Envirocom Construction, Inc. for Project 15.90 – CBMF vertical pivot entry gates, as specified and as required, in an amount not to exceed \$172,500.00 (RTA Capital Fund, Fleet Management Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Mr. Nardi, seconded by Mayor Clough and approved by unanimous vote.
- K. 2018-20 – Authorizing Contract No. 2017-163 with Alliance National LTD. dba DeMilta Iron & Metal LTD. for the recycling of scrap metal, as required, for a period of four years (revenue generating), the adoption of which was moved by Mayor Welo, seconded by Mr. Serrano and approved by unanimous vote.
- L. 2018-21 – Authorizing Contract No. 2017-168 with BLD Door Service, LLC, dba Overhead Door Company of Akron, for overhead door repair, as specified and as required, for a period of three years in an amount not to exceed \$360,000.00 (General Fund, Service Management Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Mayor Clough, seconded by Mr. Serrano and approved by unanimous vote.
- M. 2018-22 – Authorizing Contract No. 2018-002 with Oracle Corporation for the purchase of Oracle software maintenance and support services for a period of one year in an amount not to exceed \$513,990.24 (General Fund, Information Technology Department budget), the adoption of which was moved by Mayor Clough, seconded by Mayor Elkins and approved by unanimous vote.
- N. 2018-23 – Amending Resolution No. 2017-117 to provide for an appropriation for the Law Enforcement Fund in the amount of \$8,000, the adoption of which was moved by Mr. Nardi, seconded by Mayor Welo and approved by unanimous vote.

This will be used to buy 22 replacement protective vest for Transit Police.

- O. 2018-24 – Approving a new three-year Collective Bargaining Agreement covering conditions of employment with the Fraternal Order of Police/Ohio Labor Council, Inc., the adoption of which was moved by Mr. Nardi, seconded by Mr. Serrano and approved by unanimous vote.
- P. 2018-25 – Approving the Authority's 2018 Rail System Safety Program Plan (RSSPP), the adoption of which was moved by Mayor Elkins, seconded by Mr. Nardi and approved by unanimous vote.

This was discussed in committee. The new regulations require the Board to approve the Safety Plan. Ohio is the first State in the U.S. to have its safety certification plan approved by the federal government. If you have a rail system in your state without an approved plan, no transit systems in the state will receive any federal funding.

General Manager/Secretary-Treasurer's Report

Sales tax was down in January by 12.3%, 2.7% below anticipated number. Ridership is following the national trend of being down. Total ridership was down 6% in January. Bus is down 7%. Rail is down 4%. Paratransit is down 5%. CSU Line is up 4%. MetroHealth Line is up 3%. HL is down 18%. As the fare collection process was changed last October, there has been a significant decline in counted rides, however revenue is up. While ridership is down, paid ridership is up. Mobile ticket sales crossed \$300,000. A segment that TV-19 did on the ease of using the Park-N-Ride was played. A fire several months ago at the Brookpark Station damaged a transformer. The first one was replaced. A second one needs replacing. An RFP will be brought to the Board. E. 34th Street and E. 105th Street Station work is ongoing. Joe thanked the emeritus CAB members. New members will be sought for the CAC with a focus on advocacy.

The President of the U.S. introduced his budget last year, which is not public transit friendly. The goal of any major capital project would be less than 40% federal funding. There is some talk from the White House to increase the federal gas tax, which hasn't been increased since 1993. FTA's new administrator is Thelma Drake. She has roots in Elyria, Ohio. She is currently the Assistant Transportation Director in Norfolk. Joe attended APTA's General Managers meeting last week. Jane Williams, FTA assistant director talked about some of the administrative proposals and TIGER announcement coming soon. RTA submitted a \$12 MI proposal to finish track work in Tower City. He spoke to members of the TSA and FBI about homeland security and terrorism. TSA's Viper program that RTA depends on during St. Patrick's Day and Browns games has been phased out of the federal budget. Experts on the future said that by 2030, 80% of people will not own cars. Everything will be electric, autonomous and shared.

A future capital project would be to install a CNG fueling station at Triskett. The buses would be stored and fueled there. A meeting is planned with the Triskett neighborhood, Feb. 28 at 6:30 p.m. The concern from the community is noise, but it will be located between the facility and the track to cut down on noise. Along with the union, the 2018 TEAM goals were established. Three of the goal were met and will have a payout for 2017. AASTO released the report on state funding per capita. Neighboring states get \$140 per capita. Ohio went from \$0.65 to \$0.63. Greater Ohio Policy Center put together a group to discuss transit funding. Joe and Mark Danagy from Dayton are on the committee. They will put together some advocacy information to discuss with the gubernatorial candidates and the new state legislature in the fall.

The 2018 budget amendment will be presented next month. Last year ended \$24 MI to the end of budget. In conversations with the state and legislature, they increased the supplemental funding to \$28 MI between this year and next year. People opposed to increased taxes to fund RTA will meet, Feb. 21 at Denny's on W. 150th Street, 7 p.m. The county ask that a fee on Uber and Lyft be imposed to help RTA. The state said it's not legal, but the law could change. OPTA's new director is Curtis Stint. He retired last August as the CEO/GM of COTA. A rail shutdown is planned March 18 for Tower City work. Red Line west will be

shut down March 24-25 for Opportunity Corridor work. The Mayors and Managers Association will host their meeting at RTA Feb. 22. RTA is still the most respected system in the country. Recently visits and calls came from Tampa, Detroit and New Orleans.

Questions or comments from the audience (3 minutes)

1. Rev. Pamela Pinkney-Butts – Cleveland, OH – She disagreed with public comment time being cut from 3 minutes to 2. Her phone calls are not being returned. She was denied a position on the CAB. A bus operator told her to sit down and shut up. She is harassed by operators and gets removed from the bus. She asked for an investigation on the 90F. She inquired about her belongings stolen off route #40, July 17, 2012.
2. William Tarter – Broadview Hts, OH – He asked for clarification that paid fare revenue from the HL is up even though ridership is down. Joe confirmed. He asked if the Mayors & Managers Meeting held at RTA is open to the public and if the agenda will be available. Mayo Welo confirmed. The M&M will provide the agenda. Their meetings are held around the county.
3. George Zeller – Cleveland, OH – He didn't have his report because of the holiday and email outage at RTA. Sales tax was down 9.7%. The State figures were down 7.4%. The main reason is the non-auto sales tax, which is the end of the managed care sales tax. The auto sales tax is up substantially. Joe added that the State says that Uber and Lyft hasn't been paying sales tax, but they should.
4. Akshai Singh – Cleveland Hts., OH – He is a member of Clevelanders for Public Transit. They have over 1,500 members. He is interested in how relief can be found for 2018 and how they can support RTA efforts. He served on the County's subcommittee for public transit. They are looking for ways they can increase local revenue. The federal and state government is anti-transit.
5. Rich Raphael – Cleveland Hts., OH - He is a member of Clevelanders for Public Transit. CPT believes RTA has to stop depending on the state and sales tax. They are concerned about how the cuts, fare hikes and layoffs will affect the system. Localized funding solutions have to be explored. He suggested the county ideas be reviewed before the MCO tax money runs out.
6. Marvin Randalson – Lakewood, OH - He is a member of Clevelanders for Public Transit. He went to Shaw High School and grew up without a car. He used public transit to get out of poverty. He's watched the system decline over the last 20 years with fare hikes and service cuts. Service could be cut 30% between 2006 and now. Fares will have increased 125%. People are being asked to pay more for less service. This is why ridership is down. He grew up riding the 6x, 28x. His mom could work, shop and make visits on public transit back then. Today's low income children and children of color are worse off than their parents because of the declining transit system. The revenue shortfall needs to be addressed. They will ask for tax payers to support new revenue this November.


Their Fair Fares report request fares be restored to 2006 levels, to restore one-way transfers to increase the value of transit, all-boarding on the HealthLine, collaboration with regional transit partners on an efare solution and improve safety of riders and operators by refocusing TP on security, decriminalizing fare evasion and creating a Civilian Transit Ambassador program to enforce fare policy, assist riders and provide eyes on the service.

7. Joan Albro – South Euclid, OH - Her family takes the RTA. She is a retired teacher. She suggested RTA have students clean up the system.
8. Steve Albro – South Euclid, OH – He thanked staff for today's recognition of the CAB. He grew up taking public transportation. He worked at the Cleveland Sight Center. They would love the option of a self-driving car. Accessibility has been available to people with disabilities for the last 20-30 years. Buses and rail stations have become accessible and has opened transit up to a population to be independent. He encouraged everyone to work together.
9. Deborah Gray – Cleveland, OH – She lives in Ward 4 - Buckeye area. She rode the #8. Eleven years ago, a lot of buses were discontinued. A group asked RTA to get their bus back. The Board agreed to bring back 12 buses, which included their route #50, which was changed to the #58, then changed to the #8. The bus had limited hours. The #58 was changed to 6-7:30 pm instead of until 11 p.m. They agreed to the limited hours. Staff told them they would never mess with this route because of the limited hours they were presented. She is against the #8 changing from 40 minutes to one hour. The lower part of Cedar was cut to 9:30 p.m. but has service on the weekends. They don't have the weekends from University/Cedar to E. 131st.
10. Nairo – Parma, OH – When he was in high school, he rode the #68 that traveled from Brookpark and Broadview to Great Northern. For him to get across Parma, he has to take two buses. It takes 2 to 3 hours to get to the other side of Parma.
11. Lynn Solomon – Cleveland, OH - She is a member of Clevelanders for Public Transit. She's rode the RTA since 1976. She used RTA for all of her transportation needs. The system was at its best from 1976-1996. Fares were reasonable and she could go anywhere. She got a car when she started a family, but got rid of it in 2013. When she went back to riding the bus, she noticed that fares were higher and service wasn't good. She wants the system to be viable.
12. Molly Hambro – Cleveland, OH – She is a member of Clevelanders for Public Transit. The Board needs to put a transit levy on the ballot. Transit Police should patrol the routes, stations and bus stops. She works in Shaker Heights and Westlake. She can't rely on the transit system to get around. She asked for the Board to meet to speak on the CPT proposal on P. 4 of their Fair Fares Campaign.
13. Loh – Cleveland, OH – She congratulated the Board on new ideas on the budget situation. She asked if there could be more people throughout the county on the CAB. She asked if the transit system could be redesigned for more efficiency and better service. This would improve RTA's image. The federal government may cut social security so it will be hard for Paratransit customers to afford the service.

William Tarter announced that on Thursday, March 1 at 8 a.m. at Tri-C's Jerry Sue Thornton Center, there will be a County event. The panel will include County Council Yvonne Conwell, Chair of Health and Human Service Committee, Dr. Richard Jones, Dept. of Senior Adult Services and Scott Osiecki, acting CEO of ADAMHS Board of Cuyahoga County to discuss public transit as a health and human service issue. Joe thanked everyone for attending the meeting. RTA agrees with everything that was said today. RTA is doing the best with what it has. Service can't be provided for nothing. Pennsylvania provides \$148 per capita to Ohio's \$0.63. Help is needed to raise the money. George added that the Board and staff is listening and wants to work with the public. Mayor Clough added that the solution is not easy and it may take various ideas to help.

The next regular Board Meeting and Annual Meeting is scheduled for Tuesday, March 27, 2018, in the George F. Dixon, III Board Room of the Authority, Root-McBride Building, 1240 West Sixth Street, Cleveland, Ohio 44113.

This meeting was adjourned at 10:23 a.m.



President

Attest:



CEO, General Manager/Secretary-Treasurer