W.25th St TOD Plan Recommendations
Project Purpose

Connect W. 25th St Station with the neighborhood

- Physical modifications to station
- Transit-Oriented Development
Project Team Working Group
Maribeth Feke, GRTA
Tom McNair, Ohio City Inc.
Cory Riordan, Tremont West

Team

Steering Committee
Melinda Bartizal, ODOT District 12
Joe Cimperman, Cleveland City Council
Sam Erickson, GCRTA Operations
Liz Forester/Tracey Nichols, Cleveland Economic Dev.
Alicia Hudson, Tremont Board, Duck Island
Trevor Hunt/Kyle Reisz, City of Cleveland Planning
Lou Iasconi, GCRTA Property Manager
Nate Kelly, Cuyahoga Co. Dept. of Development
Rob Mavec/Andy Cross, City of Cleveland Traffic
Sam McNulty, Ohio City resident & business owner
Wayne Mortenson, NPI
John Motl, ODOT District 12
Joel Ratner, NPI
Jacob Van Sickle, Bike Cleveland
Joel Wimbiscus, Land Studio, Ohio City Board
Eric Wobser, Ohio City Inc.
Darrell Young, Market Plaza
Team

Baker
Team lead; Planning & Engineering

Dimit Architects, LLC
Architecture & Site Concepts

Zephyr Planning
Economic Analysis & Financing

Matt Hils, RLA
Urban Design & Site Concepts

Nancy Lyon-Stadler, PE, PTOE
Chris Owen

Scott Dimit, NCARB
Gary Ogrocki, RA

Todd Poole, MPA, EDFP
Relevant Plans & Projects

RTA TOD Plan

• Mixed land use surrounding station
• Easy access to live – shop – work – play
• Ground floor retail of transit & parking facilities
• Scale & architectural character of facilities
• High density
• Bike & pedestrian access

RTA TOD Best Practices

• Establish roles
  – Transit agency
  – Community

• The Development
  – Appropriate, economically feasible businesses
  – Small retail space along street
  – Direct access to neighborhood
  – Housing along transit corridor

• Play to Region’s Strengths
  – Reduce need for car (affordable housing)
  – Design housing for target market
Relevant Plans & Projects

Canal Basin District Plan
• Alternate mode connectivity to Canal Basin Park & Towpath

City of Cleveland Complete Streets
• Recently adopted policy
Relevant Plans & Projects

Ohio City Transportation Plan

- Complete Streets
- Transit-Oriented Development
- Wayfinding

- Public Parking
- Residential Parking
- Parking Meters

Public Parking - WSM surface lot reconfiguration
Relevant Plans & Projects

Launch Lorain

- Traffic calming
- Streetscape enhancements
- Transit Waiting Environments (TWE)
- Land use & redevelopment
Relevant Plans & Projects

Market District TLCI Plan

• Importance of historic character & West Side Market
• Simplify interactions between travel modes
• Strengthen connections (physical & visual)
• Promote live/work space
Relevant Plans & Projects

Market District TLCI Plan – Public Process

Public Input

Key to a successful plan is understanding the needs of the locality and its residents. The Ohio City Vision reflects the community input provided during a series of interactive public participation sessions scheduled throughout the plan development process. Sessions included:

- A Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, Threats (SWOT) Analysis Exercise with the Steering Committee: An initial step in the planning process, the SWOT Analysis provides key insight into how the plan should be designed to fit the community.
- A Focus Group with Local Business and Property Owners: A targeted input session to discuss and understand the needs of residents and key stakeholders.
- A Focus Group with Local Transportation Representatives: An integral component of the plan, this input session provided in-depth discussions regarding the transportation issues and opportunities in the Market District.
- An Issue Identification Public Meeting: A community wide meeting with informed questions based on Steering Committee and Focus Group input; the issue identification session gathered input by conducting facilitated group discussions and written workbook responses.
- A Prioritization Public Meeting: Having developed a plan with regard to the input received, the prioritization session presented plan to the community to determine the key actions that are critically important to the residents and stakeholders of Ohio City.

This involvement engages the community in the future enhancement of the Market District. The following diagram illustrates some of the key concepts identified during the input sessions that helped shape the plan.
Relevant Plans & Projects

Market District TLCI Plan – Public Process

**SWOT Analysis**
- **Key Strengths:**
  - Strong Anchors (West Side Market, St. Ignatius)
  - Close Proximity to Downtown
  - Many Local Artisanal Businesses
  - Distinctive Restaurants
  - Strong Residential Market
  - Diverse Population

- **Key Opportunities:**
  - Need for Accommodations
  - Infill Development
  - Additional Recreational Space within the District
  - Improvement of Connections Between Anchors & Citywide Attractions
  - Marketing & Programming to Showcase the District
  - Historic Architecture

- **Key Weaknesses:**
  - Lack of Retail Shopping Diversity
  - No Clear Connections to the City
  - No Visible Gateways Announcing the District
  - Too Much Parking within the District
  - Unattractive View to the District

- **Key Threats:**
  - Need for Maintenance
  - Parking Availability within the District
  - Confusing & Dangerous Traffic Circulation
  - Perceived Safety & Security Issues
  - Competition with Other Districts

---

**Public Meeting:**
- **Issue Identification**
  - Realizing Consensus:
    - 94% of participants agree the District needs to foster the development of new commercial, retail, and restaurant businesses.
    - 50% of participants agree the District has intersections and/or other locations that create significant traffic concerns.
    - 90% of participants agree the District has many buildings that should be removed and/or reused in some new way.
    - 97% of participants agree navigating the District should be more understandable.

**Focus Groups**
- Experts
  - Discuss Key Concerns
  - Regarding Existing Circulation/Wayfinding & Future Potentials for the Market District

---

**Public Meeting:**
- **Prioritization**
  - Top Development Priorities:
    - Local Wayfinding Signage
    - Beautification & Streetscape Improvements on W. 25th & Lorain
    - New RTA Signature Station
    - Parking Structure (any location)
    - Transit Oriented Development (TOD) Residential Buildings
    - Market Avenue Alley (Promenade adjacent to the West Side Market)
Relevant Plans & Projects

Market District TLCI Plan – Recommendations
Project Understanding

*W.25th Street Station and ¼ mi radius Study Area*
Project Goal & Objectives

GOAL: Connect W.25th St Station with the neighborhood

OBJECTIVES:

• Leverage presence of W. 25th Street Station and improve connectivity with surrounding neighborhoods (Ohio City, Tremont, Flats/Rivergate)

• Provide physical modifications to station to facilitate access from adjacent neighborhoods

• Enhance transportation network to better balance accommodations for all travel modes (motorized and non-motorized)

• Support livable, walkable environment

• Support and enhance transit ridership

• Incorporate economically feasible Transit-Oriented Development (TOD)
  – Support 16-hour activity within the study area
  – Incorporate underutilized and publically owned land
  – Provide site-specific development recommendations
  – Incorporate overlay zoning and innovation zones, as appropriate
Transit-Oriented Development Area

- **Primary TOD focus area**
  - RTA station
  - Market Square shopping center

- **Secondary area**
  - Duck Island
  - North of Lorain & east of RTA station
  - West Side Market parking area
  - East of W.25th Street & north of WSM
  - West of W.25th Street
Regional Study Areas

Cleveland Metropolitan Statistical Area (MSA)

10-minute Drive Contour Primary Market Area (PMA)

W. 25th Street Station (TOD site)
0.25-mile radius

Source: US Census Bureau; Esri; 4ward Planning LLC, 2012
TOD Comparison Study Areas

- Little Italy-Univ. Circle RTS
  - 0.25-mile radius

- W. 25th Street Station (TOD site)
  - 0.25-mile radius

- Shaker Square Station
  - 0.25-mile radius

Source: US Census Bureau; Esri; 4ward Planning LLC, 2012
Economics & Density

• Primary market area
  – 5-mile radius
  – 10-minute drive
  – 14,000-18,000 new residential dwelling units within next 10 years

• TOD area
  – 10% of primary market area
  – 1,400-1,800 new dwelling units
  – Propose build-out density that fits on site and is consistent with neighborhood character.
DUCK ISLAND‐TREMONT
Infill residential
‐ Townhouses on Columbus
‐ Other opportunities by parcel
‐ Strengthen connection to Abbey & Tremont
‐ Facilitate bikeway connections
  ‐ Abbey / W. 20th / Lorain
  ‐ Wiley to Train
  ‐ Towpath Trail

WEST OF W.25th ST
Infill south of Lorain
‐ Multi-family residential
  ‐ 200-300 dwelling units
  ‐ +/- 8 stories
‐ Zero lot line buildings
‐ Rear surface parking

WSM PARKING AREA
‐ Facilitate at grade ped crossing
‐ Consolidate driveways
‐ Reconfigure parking area

EAST OF W.25th-NORTH OF WSM
‐ No change
  ‐ Maintain CHMA, urban garden, church property
‐ Facilitate non-motorized access
  ‐ Extend L-C Trail to CMHA
  ‐ Support connection to Lake Link Trail

NORTH OF LORAIN-EAST OF STATION
‐ Gateway treatment
  ‐ Introduction to pedestrian area
  ‐ Traffic calming
‐ Residential (under development)
  ‐ Abode Living
  ‐ 85-100 units
  ‐ Benefits from gateway on Lorain
‐ Bikeway Connections
  ‐ Extend Lorain-Carnegie trail
  ‐ Connections to Towpath
  ‐ W.20th St & Abbey
Roadway Reconfiguration

- Reduce width of Lorain Ave
  - Maintain 5-lane cross section
  - Standard lane widths
- Remove on-street parking (south)
- Reconfigure W.24th-Gehring/Lorain
- Realign Gehring/Abbey
- Extend L-C Bikeway
- Streetscape opportunities
- Green street opportunities
Roadway Reconfiguration
Lorain Avenue

SECTION LOOKING WEST

ELEVATION LOOKING NORTH
WSM Parking Area +

• Create “Front Door” at southeast entrance
  – Pedestrian connectivity
  – Outdoor dining
  – Flow from WSM parking lot
  – Flow from Market Plaza and RTA station

• Reconfigure parking lot
  – Maximize parking spaces
  – Efficient circulation

• Enhance pedestrian experience
  – Enhanced pavement treatments
  – Pedestrian-scale lighting
  – Reconfiguration of Lorain/Gehring-W.24th St
  – N-S connectivity to RTA station and Market Plaza

• Create north-south bicycle facility
  – Parallel W.25th St
  – Connect to Lake Link Trail, L-C Trail, Detroit

• Green infrastructure
  – Visual Impact: Bioretention
  – Lower maintenance: Pervious pavement and tree biofiltration

• Intro gateway at W.20th St
  – Planters between W.20th and W.24th St

• Establish visual connection between RTA station, park, WSM and Market Square
Imagining Green Space
• Enhance bus/rail transfer, especially #81, #51 and Red Line Station
  – Station relocations (#51 and #81) on Lorain, W.25th St and collocated with Red Line Station
• Reconfiguring kiss-n-ride area
• If Gehring is closed, shift #51 to Lorain- W.25th St, with stop on W.25th south of Lorain intersection
• If Gehring is open, could reroute #51 off Gehring to enhance ped environment
  – Traffic operations must function acceptably at W.25th/Lorain intersection
  – Bus movement (WB left) must be LOS D or better at W.25th/Lorain
• Or, if Gehring is open and #51 remains in place, provide parallel parking (on-street)
Station Area Enhancements

**STATION ACCESS**
- Enhance bus/rail transfer and links to adjacent transit stops
  - Extend head house south to Abbey and west to W.24th St with covered walkway
  - Provide streetscape amenities
- Reconfigure kiss-n-ride as ped plaza

**STATION PLATFORM**
- Columbus /Tremont connection: Extend head house south to Abbey and west to W.24th St with covered walkway
- Provide covered bike parking
- Landscape area west of RTA tracks, hillside
- Collaborate with Red Line Greenway plans
Station Area Enhancements
Concept A - Phase 1

redevelopment - Gehring closed

TOD- W. 25th Street RTA Station and District
Ohio City District in Cleveland, Ohio

PHASE 1A - VACATE GEHRING

May 10, 2013
Concept A - Phase 2

redevelopment - Gehring closed

Building 1:
16,000-19,000 S.F. (Retail at grade)
4 floors of 24 units per floor
90-96 Units Total

Building 2:
10,000-14,000 S.F. (Retail at grade)
4 floors of 12 units per floor
36-48 Units Total

Parking Garage:
5 levels (1 level below grade)
+/- 90 Spaces per level
450 Spaces Total

TOTAL RETAIL: 32,000 - 37,000 S.F.
RESIDENTIAL PARKING: 95-125
RETAIL PARKING: 225-245
TOTAL PARKING REQ'D: 365-400
PARKING ALLOCATED: 555-565
Concept A - Phase 3

Building 1:
16,000-19,000 S.F. (Retail at grade)
4 floors of 24 units per floor
90-96 Units Total

Building 2:
10,000-14,000 S.F. (Retail at grade)
4 Floors of 12 units per Floor
36-48 Units Total

Parking Garage:
5 levels (1 level below grade)
450 Spaces Total

Building 3:
Mix-used Residential over Retail & Live/Work
5 Floors of 20 units per floor
100 Units Total

TOTAL RETAIL: 32,000-37,000 S.F.
RESIDENTIAL PARKING: 230-250
RETAIL PARKING: 225-245
TOTAL PARKING REQ'D: 455-495
PARKING ALLOCATED: 555-575

redevelopment - Gehring closed
Concept B - Phase 1

redevelopment - Gehring open

TOD- W. 25th Street RTA Station and District
Ohio City District in Cleveland, Ohio

PHASE 1B - GEHRING REMAINS
May 10, 2013
Concept B - Phase 2

Building 1:
16,000-19,000 S.F. (Retail at grade)
4 floors of 24 units per floor
96-96 Units Total

Building 2:
10,000-14,000 S.F. (Retail at grade)
4 floors of 12 units per floor
36-48 Units Total

Parking Garage:
5 levels (1 level below grade)
4+/- 75 Spaces per level
375 Spaces Total

TOTAL RETAIL: 32,000 - 37,000 S.F.
RESIDENTIAL PARKING: 95-125
RETAIL PARKING: 225-245
TOTAL PARKING REQ'D: 365-400
PARKING ALLOCATED: 465-485

redevelopment - Gehring open
Concept B - Phase 3

redevelopment - Gehring open

Building 1:
16,000-19,000 S.F. (Retail at grade)
4 floors of 24 units per floor
96-98 Units Total

Building 2:
10,000-14,000 S.F. (Retail at grade)
4 floors of 30 units per floor
120 Units Total

Parking Garage:
5 levels (1 level below grade)
75 Spaces per level
375 Spaces Total

Building 3:
Mixed Use, Residential over Retail & Live/Work
5 floors of 20 units per floor
100 Units Total

TOTAL RETAIL: 32,000 - 37,000 S.F.
RESIDENTIAL PARKING: 200-250
RETAIL PARKING: 225-245
TOTAL PARKING REQ'D: 455-495
PARKING ALLOCATED: 465-485

TOD- W. 25th Street RTA Station and District
Ohio City District in Cleveland, Ohio

PHASE 3B - GEHRING REMAINS

Baker, dimitarchitects, llc
May 10, 2013
Columbus Rd Townhomes
Next Steps

Moving forward into the next phase

- Market RTA land for joint development
- Implement RTA station enhancements
- Traffic study: Evaluate Gehring closure
- Redesign West Side Market parking area
- Move forward with Market Square redevelopment plans
- Move forward with other redevelopment plans
- Fund raising (grants, etc.)
Financial Analysis

• **Build-out scenarios are viable assuming...**
  - Surface parking and not structured parking
  - One parking space per dwelling unit
  - $1.25/s.f. average market rent for residential
  - $14/s.f. NNN rent for new retail space
  - Average vacancy rate of 5% per annum
  - $125/s.f. residential construction cost
  - $110/s.f. retail construction cost
  - An average annual ROE of 7.8% over 15 years
  - No acquisition costs
Fiscal Analysis

Build-Out of 229 DUs and 55,688 SF of retail

Projections (at stabilization)

Net Annual Revenues: $1,259,378
Net Annual Service Costs: $ 915,740

Net Fiscal Impacts: $ 343,678
Vacate Gehring

- Maximize residential units
  - 4-8 stories (3-7 residential, 1 retail)
- Quality Streetscape
  - Park/Public Area/Plaza
- Redevelop east side of Gehring
  - Phase 2 (or later)
- Parking garage opportunity
Concepts - Close Gehring

Vacate Gehring
- Redevelopment potential
- Realign W.24th St/Lorain
- Consider traffic diversions
  - W.25th St/Lorain
  - Columbus Road
  - W.20th Street
Traffic Diversions

- AM/PM peak hour volumes
- Based on 2030 Volumes from TLCI Study
- Innerbelt & Shoreway traffic adjustments included
- No additional development traffic included