

Minutes

RTA Organizational, Services and Performance Monitoring Committee Meeting

9:05 a.m., February 14, 2023

Committee Members: Biasiotta (Chair), Weiss

Other Board Members: Joyce, Koomar, Lucas, McCall, Pellot

Not present: Moss (virtual), Welch (virtual)

Staff: Birdsong Terry, Becker, Bober, Burney, Caver, Dangelo, Davidson, Fields, Fleig, Garofoli, Gautam, Kirkland, McGory, Miller, Mothes, Schipper, Tarka, Togher, Walker-Minor

Public: Gibbons, Loh, Collins, Groedel, Kleinman

The meeting was called to order at 9:05 a.m. Three (3) committee members were present. Mayor Koomar was added to the committee to establish a quorum.

RFP Procurement for Contracted Paratransit Services

Paratransit was created under the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990

- Protects the rights of persons with disabilities to use available public transportation.
- Persons who are functionally unable to use fixed-route service must be provided complementary paratransit service.
 - Complementary service is defined as equivalent day of the week, time, and geographic area.
- GCRTA is required to deliver every paratransit eligible trip without denials.

<u>Provider</u>	<u>Percentage (%) of Work</u>
<u>GCRTA</u>	<u>50.25%</u>
<u>Purchased Transportation</u>	<u>49.75%</u>

The three vendors deliver almost 20,467 trips each month

Paratransit Priorities

- Leverage Scheduling Technology
- **Improve the Customer Service Experience**
- Modernize Communication Technology
- **Increase on-time performance (OTP)**
- **Reduce on-board travel times (OBT)**

Current Status of Paratransit

- Currently in Option Year 1 (Year 4) of current contract
- Current challenges
 - Recovery of ridership post COVID-19
 - Current labor market constraints
 - Inflationary factors

To address these issues, they went out for a contract to forgo Option Year 2. Twenty percent (20%) of the focus was specifically on the People Strategy.

People Strategy & Benefits

- Successful proposers were required to:
 - Demonstrate ability to attract and retain talent
 - Increase beginning wages with annual wage increases (all contracted services will start at or above \$15/hr. with annual wage increases)
 - Demonstrate a competitive benefit package
- Benefits to GCRTA
 - Increased pool of potential candidates
 - Ability to attract employees with higher customer service-related skills
 - Reduce the risk of capacity constraints
 - Higher on-time performance and reduced on-board time

Scope of Services

- Balances people strategy with business performance metrics
- Constant audio and video recording
- Aligning liquidated damages to customer expectations
- Increases standard for customer experience expectations
- Increase in minimum accessibility percentages (50% to 80%)
- Increases liability requirements to 3rd party recommendations
- Standardizing billing methods for all vendors
- Standardizing market fuel escalator/de-escalator

This contract will provide a better customer service experience, better on-time performance and reduced onboard travel time.

Procurement Overview

The Request for Proposal (RFP) was issued on August 15, 2022. It was accessed on the GCRTA website by 50 interested parties and 7 firms proposed. The evaluation panel was comprised of various RTA departments using select criteria. They asked for hourly rates based on tiers. There are five tiers from 0% to 100% based on the percentage of work. RTA selects the tiers based on the contractor's hourly rates, capacity, ability to deliver service and expectations and contractor performance.

The 1st recommended firm is Future Age, Inc. dba Provide A Ride, located in Cleveland, Ohio. The 14% DBE goal will be achieved through utilization of Ace Taxi Services, Inc. They have done business with RTA since 2000 and has been the paratransit contractor since 2009. They proposed an amount not to exceed \$17,044,485.35 for a period of three years, and in amounts not to exceed \$6,243,059.71 and \$6,474,762.80 for each option year, respectively, for a total five-year contract amount not to exceed \$29,762,307.86.

The 2nd recommended firm is GC Logistics of Mississippi, LLC, located in Cleveland, Ohio and headquartered in Ridgeland, Mississippi. The 14% DBE goal will be achieved through utilization of We Put Family First, Kings Transportation Services, and Better Choice Transport LLC. They have worked with RTA since 2019. They proposed an amount not to exceed \$11,106,075.91 for a period of three years, and in amounts not to exceed \$3,912,322.56 and \$4,016,054.09 for each option year, respectively, for a total five-year contract amount not to exceed \$19,034,452.56.

The 3rd recommended firm is Senior Transportation Connection, located in Cleveland, Ohio. The 14% DBE goal will be achieved through utilization of We Put Family First. They have worked with RTA since 2008. They proposed an amount not to exceed \$5,400,370.89 for a period of three years, and in amounts not to exceed \$1,916,788.07 and \$1,978,398.27 for each option year, respectively, for a total five-year contract amount not to exceed \$9,295,557.23.

Contractor	Percentage (%) of Work	Total Contract Value
Future Age, Inc. dba Provide A Ride	51%	\$29,762,307.86
GC Logistics of Mississippi	33%	\$19,034,452.56
Senior Transportation Connection	16%	\$9,295,557.23

Staff requests that the Organizational, Services and Performance Monitoring Committee recommend to the Board of Trustees the awards for Contracted Paratransit Services to Future Age Inc. dba Provide A Ride in a total contract amount NTE \$29,762,307.86, to GC Logistics of Mississippi, LLC in a total contract amount NTE \$19,034,452.56, and to Senior Transportation Connection in a total contract amount NTE \$9,295,557.23, resulting in a five-year total amount NTE \$58,092,317.65. This compares to a five-year total amount NTE \$54,244,140.16 awarded under the 2019 contract, which is approximately a \$4 million different.

Mayor Biasiotta asked if the distribution of work will be consistent over the length of the contract and what the percent increase is for each year. Mr. Davidson said they will do as much work as possible inhouse first. He anticipates the percentage of work will remain consistent based on ridership demand. Each contract will have a percentage increase each year (approximately 10% for the first year and 3%-4% increase for the remaining years) to account for labor, wages, cost of living and inflation. Representatives from each contractor was represented and addressed the committee. Mayor Weiss asked for clarification on the tiers. Mr. Davidson explained that it allowed the contractors to bid different price points depending on the amount of work they wanted. The tiers could be adjusted based on performance and capacity.

Dr. Caver added that RTA has 80 paratransit vehicles. Trip scheduling is done with software. The software will optimize to give the trips to RTA first. There is more demand for service than RTA can handle so the software will utilize the contractors at that time. Ms. Birdsong Terry said there is no plan to outsource at 100%. The goal is to absorb as much as possible inhouse with our union employees. There is an FTA rule about the time limit a customer can be on the vehicle. The contractors help get customers where they want to be in a timely manner. President Lucas commended the contractors for their improved work. Mayor Biasiotta allowed the public to make comments.

Public Comment

1. Loh – Riders are not having pleasant experiences on some of the contracted paratransit service compared to the RTA service. She asked if other contractors were interested. Mayor Biasiotta added that seven (7) companies sent in proposals.

It was moved by Mayor Biasiotta, seconded by Mayor Weiss and approved to move this to the full Board.

CNG Services for Hayden District Fueling Station

John Togher, Director of Accounting and Shawn Becker, Program Contract Manager, made the presentation. We manufacture CNG at our facilities to fuel our buses with three components. Natural gas - \$1,437K. Electricity - \$142K. O&M - \$426K. Totaling \$2M for 2022. The average cost for CNG cost per diesel gallon equivalent is \$0.94 excluding the tax credit and \$0.38 with the tax credit. Our 2022 diesel fuel price averaged \$3.79/gallon. After our fuel hedging program, the price per gallon for diesel was reduced to \$2.20.

Scope of Operations & Maintenance (O&M) Services

- 24/7 Monitoring and support
- Emergency call out services
- Scheduled maintenance and emergency repairs
- All inclusive of labor, parts and consumables

Fleet at Hayden

- Fleet is currently all CNG
- 40ft – 155 CNG Coaches (driven 7.7 million miles in 2022)
- HealthLine 60ft – 16 CNG Coaches (driven 422 million miles in 2022)
- Critical that CNG fueling station is maintained, uninterrupted and available 24/7
- Disruption of CNG fueling would result in a catastrophic impact on service
- Projected O&M cost based on:
 - Anticipated miles for 40ft and 60ft coaches
 - Estimated miles per MCF for 40ft and 60ft coaches
 - Calculated Diesel Gallon Equivalent (DGE) – 2023 projection, 2.1 and 2.2 million gallons
- Monthly O&M costs = Rate X DGE Volume

Procurement Overview

This is a Sole Source with Trillium Transportation Fuels, LLC dba Trillium CNG. They are exempt from competitive solicitation per the ORC:

- Ohio Revised Code 306.43 H3
 - Original installer and provider of O&M service
- Ohio Revised Code 306.43 H6
 - Proprietary nature of programmable logic control (PLC)

Procurement requested a proposal December 29, 2022. The proposal was received January 31, 2023. A 0% DBE goal was assigned to this project. The proposal was reviewed by representatives of Accounting, Operations and Procurement.

Trillium Experience:

- Leader in CNG station construction and fuel distribution in North America
- Extensive work with public transit agencies
- Operate & maintain over 220 CNG fueling stations in over 30 states
- Invest over \$40,000 in training for each mechanic
- Extensive and experienced O&M team across more than 80% of US
- Turnkey O&M program customized to GCRTA's needs with 24/7 availability
- No preventable service interruptions to date
- Transit Experience: GCRTA, Akron Metro, Massachusetts Bay Transportation Authority, Miami-Dade Transit, New York City Transit, PACE, and Los Angeles Department of Transportation, among others.

Historical Pricing (\$ Per DGE)

Gallons per Month (DGE)	Year 3 of 3 Original Contract (2017-2018)	Year 1 of 5 Current Contract (2018-2019)	Year 5 of 5 Current Contract (2022-2023)	Year 1 of 5 Proposed Contract (2023-2024)	Year 2 of 5 Proposed Contract (2024-2025)	Year 3 - 5 Proposed Contract (2025-2028)
120,001 and above	\$0.205	\$0.180	\$0.212	\$0.212	\$0.242	\$0.262

Staff requests that the Organizational, Services & Performance Monitoring Committee recommend an award to Trillium Transportation Fuels, LLC dba Trillium CNG to provide Hayden CNG operations and maintenance services in an amount not to exceed \$3,200,000.00 for the five-year term.

Mr. Joyce asked if we would need upgrades after 10 years. Mr. Becker said they have a schedule of service upgrades. Mayor Weiss asked if RTA owns the facility. Mr. Becker said the contractor built the system and maintains it, but RTA owns it. Mayor Koomar asked about the DGE calculation. Mr. Becker said the Energy Manager does the calculation. Dr. Caver added that natural gas is sold in MCF. There is an industry wide conversion to DGE.

It was moved by Mayor Biasiotta, seconded by Mayor Weiss and approved to move to the full Board.

The meeting adjourned at 10:01 a.m.


 Rajan D. Gautam
 Secretary/Treasurer


 Theresa A. Burrage
 Executive Assistant