

Minutes

RTA Organizational, Services and Performance Monitoring Committee Meeting

9:01 a.m., November 9, 2021

Committee Members: Byrne (Chair), Moss (Vice Chair), Duarte, Serrano, Weiss

Other Board members: Joyce, McCall, Pellot

Not present: Koomar, Lucas

Staff: Becker, Benford, Birdsong, Bober, Caver, Coffey, Dangelo, Dietrich, Fields, Freilich, Garofoli, Gautam, Harris, Johnson, Krecic, Manning, McGerver, Miller, Peganoff, Schipper, Talley, Walker-Minor

Public: Gibbons, Loh

The meeting was called to order at 9:01 a.m. There were five (5) committee members present.

This meeting was live-streamed on RTA's Facebook page (www.facebook.com/rideRTA) for staff and members of the public. Members of the public were allowed to attend in-person.

Based on Centers for Disease Control (CDC) guidance to continue to avoid large events and gatherings and Ohio Department of Public Health advice that businesses and other entities may continue to require mitigation measures, as well as RTA's interest in protecting community and employee health and safety, several measures were put in place for in-person attendance, which are spelled out in the meeting notice.

RFP Procurement for Advertising Services

Natoya Walker Minor, DGM of Administration and External Affairs and Ashley Bober, Contract Administrator gave the presentation.

Scope of Work:

- Heighten GCRTA's brand to align with the Mission, *Connecting the Community*
- Position GCRTA as an anchor in the economic and workforce ecosystem
- Target diverse audiences (riders, choice riders, Millennials) with messages to increase ridership
- Develop campaigns and creative (digital and written)

Scope of Work cont'd, in partnership with GCRTA's Marketing and Communications Department:

- Design and produce GCRTA's Annual Report
- Develop GCRTA's annual marketing plan:
 - broadcast and connected television
 - radio and digital
 - robust social media and direct mail
 - market/consumer research, promotional opportunities, and special events
 - community-directed programs
- Engage partners for joint marketing promotions
- Design creative for special projects/events and public relations
- Involvement in market research and social media analytics

The Request for Proposal (RFP) was issued July 19, 2021. It was accessed on the GCRTA website by 32 interested parties and 6 firms proposed. The evaluation panel was comprised of several RTA departments using evaluation criteria. The recommended firm is Brokaw, Inc., located in Cleveland, Ohio. The 11% DBE Goal will be achieved through the use of DAR Public Relations (African American female-owned) and Media Impressions, Inc. (female-owned).

Brokaw, Inc.:

- Depth of resources (digital, strategy, creative, in-house video and photo production, and media planning and buying)

- Network (leveraging of clients like University Hospitals, Cleveland Foundation, University Circle, Inc., Cleveland Museum of Natural History, GE Lighting, etc.)
- Proximity (their offices are across the street)
- Significant past experience and great working relationship with the Authority for the previous 20 years
- Thoroughly understands the Authority's new mission, vision, and strategic plan and the need to engage employees, customers, and the community

Other Clients include:

- Cleveland Foundation
- University Hospitals
- University Circle, Inc.
- Cleveland Hopkins International Airport
- Cleveland Museum of Natural History
- GE Lighting
- Sherwin-Williams
- Nestle

Staff requests that the Organizational, Services & Performance Monitoring Committee recommend an award to Brokaw, Inc. to provide Advertising Services for a period of one year in an amount not to exceed \$850,000.00, with two, one-year options in an amount not to exceed \$850,000.00 for each option year, for a total contract amount not to exceed \$2,550,000.00. This project will be funded through the General Fund.

Mayor Weiss asked how the fee works. Ms. Bober said it is based on an hourly rate. Ms. Walker Minor added that when there is a campaign, they would have to project the cost for control purposes. Once they discuss the campaign, it is approved in-house. They finalize and approve the cost per campaign. Ms. Birdsong asked the staff to touch on the competitive process since we have been with Brokaw for a while. Ms. Bober said when the RFP is advertised, there is a detailed scope and criteria. They received six proposals. The information regarding who was interviewed is in the summary of proposed award, which is confidential. Based on the proposals, they shortlist firms based on the criteria. They brought in three firms to interview. They were very thorough interviews. They had hard conversations with all firms. After the interviews, they invited the firms to submit the best and final offer, which allows them to change anything in their proposal based on their interview. There was a lot of interest in the project, but Brokaw was most thorough and thoughtful in their responses in the best and final and during their interview.

Ms. Walker Minor added that she was transparent that she wants to bring more work in-house to build our talent base with vacancies to reduce the contract amount. Historically this contract has been two years with three one-year options. For better control, it changed to one year with two one-year options so they can contract manage better. They told the contractors that they want monthly strategic meetings.

It was moved by Mr. Serrano, seconded by Mayor Byrne. There were five (5) ayes and none opposed to move this to the full Board.

Bus Option

Dan Dietrich, Director of Fleet Management and Glenville Manning, Contract Administrator gave the presentation. This is an exercise of an option under Contract No. 2020-071 with Gillig, LLC for the purchase of up to 20, 40-ft CNG coaches. RTA operates fixed route buses that serve over 75% of our customers. To provide safe, reliable and cost effective service, buses must be replaced on a regular cycle. FTA recommends replacement of transit buses at twelve years.

Special Features include:

- Passenger Information System – real time information, advertising, route information, news, etc. on 1 screen.
- Telematics – real time data sent via cellular to maintenance
- Next-gen 4k Security Camera System (360°) – upgrade of older system

- Network Pre-wire at all doors for future fare collection – flexibility for future fare collection
- Contoured Plastic Seats – easy cleaning and low maintenance
- Vented tip-in windows

The Board of Trustees approved Resolution No. 2021-022 on March 23, 2021, authorizing Contract No. 2020-071 with Gillig, LLC. for the manufacture and delivery of up to twenty (20), 40 ft. CNG coaches, spare parts, tooling and training in an amount not to exceed \$11,052,060.00 with options to procure up to eighty (80) additional coaches, spare parts, tooling and training to be delivered over the five (5) year contract term. There is a critical need to replace additional coaches that have exceeded their useful life. Funding has been identified to procure up to twenty (20) new coaches under a contract option. Gillig, LLC. will have capacity available to meet GCRTA's production need.

Delivery Schedule:

- Anticipated delivery of these twenty (20), 40-ft CNG coaches are scheduled to be completed in the 3rd quarter of 2022.
- These twenty (20) coaches will be in addition to the base order of twenty (20) coaches, bringing the total delivery to forty (40) coaches by the end of September, 2022.

Staff requests that the Organizational, Services & Performance Monitoring Committee recommend to the Board of Trustees the award of a contract option with Gillig, LLC for the purchase and delivery of up to an additional twenty (20), 40-ft CNG coaches, in an amount not to exceed \$11,211,397.40. This purchase will be funded from the RTA Development Fund, including multiple Capital Grants.

Ms. Pellot got on the bus outside and liked the amenities (sanitizer, screens, seats). Mr. Dietrich explained that the bus outside is a different bus, but there will be similar features on these buses. Mayor Weiss asked what happens to the busses once they are replaced. Ms. Dietrich said they take off any equipment they can reuse. Then the buses are placed on GovDeals.com. which is an auction site. Typically, the buses are beyond their useful life so scrap yards will buy them. It was moved by Ms. Moss, seconded by Mr. Serrano. There were five (5) ayes and none opposed to move this to the full Board.

RFP Procurement: Exterior graphics on the 40 ft. CNG bus fleet

Dan Dietrich, Director of Fleet Management and Mabry Harris, Contract Administrator gave the presentation. This procurement is for bus exterior graphics production and installation services on up to 80 CNG coaches over a five (5) year term. GCRTA's current fleet of Gillig 40' CNG buses is furnished with an exterior graphics package that includes a special angle-cut window design. This design is service proven and has provided extended longevity for adhesion and color retention. This contract is for the production and application of the exterior graphics on new Gillig buses. The graphic material utilized is a high quality vinyl product designed for commercial vehicle/bus exterior application. The window graphics include an angle cut design that provides years of longevity as compared to the perforated product, which typically lasts a year. They have not had to replace the window graphics for bubbling and peeling for 6-7 years. All graphics in this package have a 5-year warranty. Graphics are perforated or angled. They both allow the same visual (70% material / 30% see through).

The RFP was issued July 19, 2021. Twenty (20) interested parties downloaded the package. Three (3) vendors proposed. The evaluation panel consisted of various RTA departments using the evaluation criteria. The recommended vendor is Applied Graphics, Ltd. A 12% DBE Participation Goal was assigned to this project by the Office of Business Development. Applied Graphics, Ltd. is a certified DBE firm and will perform 100% of the work.

Current Clients include:

- Greater Cleveland RTA (GCRTA)
- New Flyer Industries
- Washington Metro Area Transit (WMATA)
- Broward County Transit, Florida
- Farber Specialty Vehicles, Columbus, OH

Applied Graphics, Ltd. has offered to provide bus exterior graphics production and installation services for up to 80 CNG coaches at negotiated annual unit prices of \$4,473.00 for year one, \$4,509.00 for year two, \$4,545.00 for year three, \$4,582.00 for year four and \$4,619.00 for year five for a total negotiated contract total not to exceed \$362,550.00 for the five year contract term. Staff requests that the Organizational, Services & Performance Monitoring Committee recommend to the Board of Trustees the award of a contract to Applied Graphics, Ltd., for the procurement of Bus Exterior Graphics Production and Installation Services for up to 80 CNG coaches over a five year term in an amount NTE \$362,550.00 and funding in an amount NTE \$89,460.00 for the first 20 coaches. This purchase will be funded from the RTA Development Fund, 100% Local Funds.

Ms. Moss asked if this company handles the bus wraps. Mr. Dietrich said that is under another contract under the Marketing Department. Mr. Joyce asked how long it takes to get the graphics on the bus. Mr. Dietrich said Gillig is located in California. It is a two-day turnaround to wrap the bus and bring the bus to Cleveland. Ms. Duarte wants to ensure that riders can see outside the bus through the wrapping. Mr. Dietrich said the 70/30 is a transit industry standard. They will ensure when buses are wrapped, the visual impairment is minimal. Ms. Birdsong added they would monitor each ad placed on the coaches. Other transit systems have used different programs to identify specific windows for the ads without impairing visibility.

It was moved by Mayor Weiss, seconded by Ms. Moss. There were five (5) ayes and none opposed to move this to the full Board.

The meeting was adjourned at 9:28 a.m.


Rajan D. Gautam
Secretary/Treasurer


Theresa A. Burrage
Executive Assistant