



GREATER CLEVELAND
REGIONAL TRANSIT
AUTHORITY

INTERNAL AUDIT
QUARTERLY REPORT
First Quarter - 2017

May, 2017

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page(s)</u>
INTRODUCTION	2
2017 INTERNAL AUDIT PLAN	3-4
COMPLETED PROJECTS	5-7
PROJECTS IN PROGRESS	8-12
SPECIAL REQUESTS AND EMERGING ISSUES	13-16
EXTERNAL AUDIT COORDINATION AND FOLLOW-UP	17
STATUS OF OUTSTANDING FOLLOW-UP	18-21
OTHER PROJECTS	22
STAFF TRAINING	23
STAFF PROFILES	24

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

INTRODUCTION

Presented herein and in accordance with Board Policy is the report of the Internal Audit Department activities for the First Quarter 2017. The report outlines work performed, recommendations and management's responses, including specific steps for the implementation of all agreed-upon recommendations and other pertinent data.

The Internal Audit Department is an independent appraisal function established within the Authority to examine and evaluate its activities as a service to the Board of Trustees and management. The objective is to assist management in the effective discharge of their responsibilities. To this end, Internal Audit furnishes management with analyses, appraisals, recommendations, counsel and information concerning the activities reviewed. The audit objective includes promoting effective control at reasonable cost.

The Internal Audit Department will respond to the Board of Trustee requests for audit services in a timely manner. Please contact me at (216) 566-5064 to service your requests.



4/26/17

Anthony A. Garofoli
Executive Director of Internal Audit

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

2017 INTERNAL AUDIT PLAN

Contract Audits

Blanket Purchase Orders
Brookpark Rapid Transit Station Rehabilitation
Fiber Optic Network Replacement
Elevator/Escalator Maintenance
Marketing/Advertising Consultant
Supplemental Paratransit Services
Third-Party Risk Assessment
Tire Lease/Services
Towing
Track Replacement
U-Pass Programs (CSU, CWRU, CCC)
Vehicle Purchases
Vehicle Warranty Program

Internal Audits

Claims Processing
Construction Management Standards
Customer Service Center Operations
Facilities Access System
Environmental Management System – ISO 14001
Fare Collection System Maintenance
Fuel Hedging Program
Internal Audit – Internal Assessment
IRS I-9 Employment Form Review
Paratransit Eligibility
Petty Cash
Purchasing Card Program
Safety System Program Plan
Service Quality Operations
Transit Police Compensation Time
Signal Maintenance Program
Transit Police System Security Plan
Travel Expense Reimbursement
Work Orders – Controls Review

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

2017 INTERNAL AUDIT PLAN

Information Technology Audits

Accrued Leave
Data Backup & Recovery
Health Care Claims
Information Technology Systems Security
Software License Agreements
Telephone System Replacement

Continuous Auditing Program - *

Accounts Payable
Accounts Receivable
Fuel Expense
Inventory Management
Payroll
Revenue Collection

External Audits

Ohio Department of Transportation
Federal Transit Administration
State of Ohio – Office of the Auditor
US Department of Homeland Security

Revenue Audits

Fare Evasion
Fare Media Inventory
Lease Revenue
Mobile Ticketing
Special Event Collections

Staff Training
Audit Recommendation Follow-up
15% of budgeted hours will be reserved for Special Requests and/or Emerging Issues

**Continuous Auditing is achieved through the use of audit software tools to assure the internal control system is functioning to detect fraud, errors and waste.

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

COMPLETED PROJECTS

GCRTA Employee Travel & Expense Account Reimbursements

Purpose:

The Internal Audit Department reviews all employee travel expenses to ensure they are properly approved and are reimbursed in accordance with the Authority's policies and procedures.

Scope:

Internal Audit reviewed all requests for employee travel expense reimbursements for the period January 1, 2017 through March 31, 2017 prior to cash disbursement. The review included tests for allowability, reasonableness and timeliness.

Results:

All requests were reviewed and, if necessary, adjusted to comply with applicable policies and procedures.

Customer Fare Collections

Purpose:

To evaluate and provide assurance customer fares, collected from fare collections systems are reconciled, posted to accounting records and deposited in the bank.

Scope:

Internal Audit Staff developed a continuous audit test, utilizing audit software, to query the fare collections systems data to reconcile with cash counts, GCRTA accounting records and third-party bank deposits. The audit script executes daily. Any exceptions are noted for investigation with appropriate management.

Results:

No exceptions were noted during the First Quarter 2017.

Vehicle Purchases

Purpose:

Contract 2013-100 with Gillig, LLC, was authorized for the purchase and delivery of up to sixteen 40-ft. low floor CNG coaches, training, special tools and spare parts.

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

COMPLETED PROJECTS

The Federal Transit Administration obligates federal funds to the GCRTA for purchasing buses to carry passengers in mass transit service. Recipients of these funds must comply with several federal regulations, one of which is the Pre-Award and Post Delivery Rule.

Scope:

Audit Staff completed the applicable Buy America Review, required by Federal Transit Administration.

Results:

(16) Bus Order: Audit staff completed Post-Delivery Review. This included an on-site review of contractor records, toured the manufacturer's final assembly plant, inspected the vehicles and reviewed GCRTA records. Both the contractor and GCRTA management complied with federal regulations. Considering this result, GCRTA management transferred title and can place the vehicles in revenue service.

Central Bus Maintenance Facility – Environmental & Sustainability Management System

Purpose:

The ISO 14001 standard represents a core set of standards used by organizations for designing and implementing an effective Environmental & Sustainability Management System (ESMS).

Management achieved the ISO 14001 certification for the Central Bus Maintenance Facility during 2016.. This included documented sustainable and environmental processes for the use and/or disposal of certain elements such as rags, scrap metals, waste oil and other elements.

The standards include an annual internal audit component to evaluate conformance.

Scope:

- Determination of the extent of conformity with the management system to be audited, or parts of it, with audit criteria;
- Determination of the extent of conformity of activities, processes and products with the requirements and procedures of the management system;
- Evaluation of the capability of the management system to ensure compliance with legal and contractual requirements and other requirement to which the organization is committed;
- Evaluation of the effectiveness of the management system in meeting its specified objectives;

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

COMPLETED PROJECTS

- Identification of areas for potential improvement of the management system.

Results:

(17) Checklist items with multiple criteria were audited for conformance with the current ISO 14001:2004 standard. Audit findings yielded (7) total non-conformances (2 – Major; 5 – Minor) amongst different checklist items. Management is implementing corrective actions to conform to ESMS standards.

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

PROJECTS IN PROGRESS

Health Care Benefits - Claims Audit

(Board Resolution – 2010-081 - Medical Mutual of Ohio)

(Board Resolution – 2011-094 - Caremark PCS Health, LLC (Caremark))

(Board Resolution – 2010-083 - MetLife Securities, Inc.)

Purpose:

GCRTA employee health care benefits expense totals approximately \$20,000,000 annually. The Board of Trustees authorized:

Contract No. 2010-72A with Medical Mutual of Ohio to provide medical plan insurance coverage;

Contract No. 2011-108 with Caremark PCS Health, LLC (Caremark) to provide a managed prescription drugs benefit program; and

Contract No. 2010-72C with MetLife Securities, Inc. to provide dental insurance coverage

Scope:

Internal Audit will perform a healthcare claims audit to evaluate third-party administrator compliance with respective plan designs and contract terms and conditions for the period January 1, 2012 through December 31, 2014.

Update:

Field work is complete for the period January 1, 2012 through December 31, 2013. The audit identified several issues to discuss with the respective third-party administrators. We engaged an audit consultant to co-source this work.

Contract provisions require us to complete the 2-year audit before we can analyze the 2014-15 calendar year claims.

Information Technology Security

Purpose:

Management relies on data from a variety of business and intelligent transportation systems. Audit staff will evaluate controls over user access to GCRTA mission critical systems.

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

PROJECTS IN PROGRESS

Scope:

The scope of the audit is to evaluate whether user access to GCRTA's network, applications and data is adequately controlled, including the process for granting, maintaining and removing such access. We will also evaluate administrator rights, password management and policy awareness.

GCRTA – Cleveland State University Student Universal Access Fare Program (U-Pass Program)
(Board Resolution 2004-001)

Purpose:

The GCRTA entered into an agreement to provide prepaid and universal access to public transportation services. Each full time student pays a flat fee per semester and is able to ride GCRTA services on an unlimited basis during the semester.

Scope:

Internal Audit will evaluate compliance with the agreement.

GCRTA – Case Western Reserve University Student Universal Access Fare Program (U-Pass Program)
(Board Resolution 2008-127)

Purpose:

The GCRTA entered into an agreement to provide prepaid and universal access to public transportation services. Each full time student pays a flat fee per semester and is able to ride GCRTA services on an unlimited basis during the semester.

Scope:

Internal Audit will evaluate compliance with the agreement.

GCRTA – Cuyahoga Community College Student Universal Access Fare Program (U-Pass Program)
(Board Resolution 2015-62)

Purpose:

The GCRTA entered into an agreement to provide prepaid and universal access to public transportation services. GCRTA and CCC agreed upon a semester rate, with an

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

PROJECTS IN PROGRESS

escalation clause through 2021. Students are able to ride GCRTA services on an unlimited basis during the semester.

Scope:

Internal Audit will evaluate compliance with the agreement.

Workers' Compensation/Third-Party Claims - Process Review

Purpose:

The Legal Division contracted with an insurance company to evaluate internal controls and processes to manage workers' compensation and third-party claims.

Scope:

- Effective use of the computerized risk management computer system
- Tests of risk factors identified through an assessment of various processes

Human Resources Hiring Process

Purpose:

The objective of the audit is to assess the efficiency and effectiveness of the Authority's current hiring process.

Scope:

- Evaluate the consistent application of hiring policies and procedures
- Evaluate the staffing levels and workloads of Human Resources employees
- Review a sample of recruitments performed by Human Resources, including reviewing applications, resumes, scoring and final selection

Tower City - Customer Service Center

Purpose:

The Tower City – Customer Service Center (CSC) is a GCRTA sales outlet for customers to purchase fare media (tickets) and pay fare violation fines; a customer lost & found center, a customer information center; and provides other services for customers. The CSC employees handle cash, credit card payments and ticket inventory.

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

PROJECTS IN PROGRESS

Scope:

Internal Audit Staff will conduct un-announced (surprise) audits to reconcile cash, ticket consignment and other assets. We will also evaluate internal controls and management processes.

St. Patrick's Day – Special Event Collections

Purpose:

Special events require extraordinary resources, the sale of unique fare media, processes to collect fares and processes to manage customer traffic flow.

Scope:

Internal Audit will evaluate the internal controls in place to achieve the management objectives:

- Fare media printing and handling
- Cash Collection
- Human Resource deployment and overtime management

Transit Police - Compensation Time

Purpose:

The Collective Bargaining Agreement between GCRTA and the Transit Police provides Transit Police Officers will receive Compensation Time for specific activities, including court appearances and other services. Employees can bank, use time in lieu of hours worked and elect a cash payment for time earned.

Scope:

Internal Audit will evaluate the internal controls in place to achieve the management objectives and compliance with the Collective Bargaining Agreement provisions:

- Capture and recording of time earned
- Processing of time earned in lieu of work hours
- Cash payment of time earned

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

PROJECTS IN PROGRESS

Main Office Building - ADA Customer Service Center

Purpose:

Customers who are unable, as a result of a physical or mental impairment, may qualify to use GCRTA Paratransit services as outlined by the Americans with Disabilities Act. These customers are required to complete an application. GCRTA management reviews the application to evaluate eligibility. Customers, approved to use Paratransit Services are included in a computerized system, which is used to schedule trips.

Scope:

Internal Audit Staff will evaluate the internal controls in place to achieve the management objectives and compliance with ADA laws and regulations:

- Application evaluation and reconciliation with the computerized system
- Cash handling
- Paratransit Customer Identification Badge processing
- Database management and records retention

Continuous Auditing

Purpose:

Continuous Auditing defines the technologies and processes that allow an on-going review and analysis of business information on a real time basis. Internal Audit will monitor specific information electronically and incorporate the use of intelligent agents, computer modeling and other software tools. Continuous auditing will give end users of information more timely assurance that information is correct and may eventually lead to continuous reporting where business information is updated and published as events occur.

Scope:

The General Manager identified and monitors “Key Performance Indicators.” These include Revenue and Absence Control. Internal Audit will assist management to develop continuous “monitoring” queries to provide management “real time” information to meet organizational goals. Internal Audit will develop continuous “auditing” queries to test for compliance and control risk.

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

SPECIAL REQUESTS AND EMERGING ISSUES

Paratransit Operations

Purpose:

In February 2015, as a result of a routine audit, RTA identified some issues regarding the dispatching and use of Paratransit services.

Scope:

Internal Audit is evaluating the Paratransit Dispatch Office operations. These activities include:

- Timekeeping
- Scheduling
- Operator Supervision

Update:

Between February 10, 2015 and March 22, 2015, Internal Audit and Transit Police conducted a joint investigation, including interviews of management, dispatchers, operators and schedulers (17 employees). We summarized our findings to meet with GCRTA management, including GCRTA Legal.

Internal Audit reviewed internal controls to identify root cause and provide management recommendations. These recommendations were implemented immediately.

The matter was referred to the County Prosecutor's Office in March 2015. The County Prosecutor referred the matter to the United States Attorney's Office – Department of Justice. GCRTA Internal Audit supported the investigation conducted by the Federal Bureau of Investigation and United States Department of Transportation – Office of the Inspector General. We were informed to suspend our internal investigation. The matter was referred back to the County Prosecutor in August 2015. On January 28, 2016, (2) former GCRTA employees and (1) active employee were indicted by a Grand Jury and various charges of fraud, theft in office and theft.

The former RTA employees were sentenced by Cuyahoga County Common Pleas Court Judge Joan Synenberg.

On August 2, 2016, Dispatcher (A) pled guilty to theft in office, a fourth-degree felony. The former Paratransit dispatcher retired last year, after the investigation into this case began. She was ordered to pay \$4,241.74 restitution to GCRTA, and perform 20 hours of community service within 6 months.

On July 28, 2016, Dispatcher (B) was convicted of unauthorized use of property/computer system, a misdemeanor. A former GCRTA employee, she had

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

SPECIAL REQUESTS AND EMERGING ISSUES

worked for a company that contracted with GCRTA to provide Paratransit rides. She was ordered to pay \$2,524.73 in restitution to GCRTA and perform 500 hours of community service, preferably to a Veteran's organization.

On May 25, 2016, Dispatcher (C) was sentenced to a diversion program. A former Paratransit dispatcher, she was fired from GCRTA.

The County Prosecutor removed the investigation suspension. Internal Audit will resume the internal investigation immediately.

Employee Vacation Account Balances

Purpose:

The Human Resources Information System Manager requested a special audit to review employee vacation accounts. She identified unreconciled differences between the payroll system balances and the time & attendance capturing system balances.

Scope:

Internal Audit will evaluate the employee accounts, system control risks and root causes to determine the scope for audit. Staff will re-calculate account balances and recommend adjustments for management consideration.

Tower City Customer Service Center Operations

Purpose:

The Transit Police Chief requested audit services to evaluate internal controls and processes at the Tower City Customer Service Center.

Scope:

Audit staff will interview employees, review management controls and support the Transit Police as requested.

Update:

This is an on-going investigation. Management immediately implemented Internal Audit recommendations to mitigate the risks of employee fraud, waste and abuse. The Tower City Customer Service Center was re-opened to service GCRTA customers.

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

SPECIAL REQUESTS AND EMERGING ISSUES

Health Care – Pharmacy Claims Expense

Purpose:

The Executive Director of Internal Audit initiated an audit to evaluate the costs of employee and their eligible dependent pharmacy claim expenses.

Scope:

Claims processed by the third-party pharmacy claims processor for the period January 1, 2015 through June 30, 2016.

Fare Evasion – Internal Controls Review

Purpose:

The General Manager/Chief Executive Officer requested an audit to estimate the rates of fare evasion and compliance. The secondary purpose is to analyze results by time and geography; and identify any trends in fare evasion.

Scope:

The scope for this audit is monitoring fare compliance and evasion for passengers required on the Red Line, Green Line, Blue Line and Health Line modes of transit. Data will be collected during various time periods and locations.

Main Office Building Parking Garage

Purpose:

A GCRTA Associate Counsel requested a compliance audit of the Reciprocal Operating and Easement Agreement by and between Lakeside Complex Limited Partnership and the GCRTA.

Scope:

Validate the existence, accuracy, completeness and apportionment of the Common Expenses per the terms and conditions of the Reciprocal Operating and Easement Agreement.

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

SPECIAL REQUESTS AND EMERGING ISSUES

Vehicle Advertising

Purpose:

A Procurement Contract Administrator requested a contract audit to evaluate compliance with terms and conditions to transfer assets and sales transactions between the former and existing contractor.

Scope:

Internal Audit will evaluate compliance with the terms and conditions of both contracts.

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

EXTERNAL AUDIT COORDINATION AND FOLLOW-UP
--

The International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Audit provides:

- 2050 – *Coordination:*
 - *“The chief audit executive should share information and coordinate activities with other internal and external providers of assurance and consulting services to ensure proper coverage and minimize duplication of efforts.*

The following Federal and State Agencies performed audits and reviews of the Authority’s policies and records during the First Quarter 2016:

- State of Ohio – Office of the Auditor
 - The State of Ohio – Office of the Auditor is conducting 2016 Financial/Single Audit.
 - External Auditors are on-site to conduct interim audit work.

- State of Ohio – Ohio Department of Transportation (ODOT)
 - ODOT selected a consultant, Vital Assurance Inc., to act as the Program Manager for Rail Safety and Security Audits.
 - Internal Audit will work with GCRTA Safety to perform the audits as required by ODOT.
 - The Consultant meets with GCRTA Management on a quarterly basis to review and follow-up on outstanding corrective action.

Internal Audit will coordinate final audit and review findings within our audit management system. Recommendations and required corrective actions will be tracked through implementation. Audit staff will review supporting evidence to close-out outstanding issues.

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

STATUS OF OUTSTANDING FOLLOW-UP
--

The International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Audit provides:

- 2500 – Monitoring Progress
 - “The chief audit executive must establish and maintain a system to monitor the disposition of results communicated to management.”
 - “The chief audit executive must establish a follow-up process to monitor and ensure that management actions have been effectively implemented or that senior management has accepted the risk of not taking action.”

(See the Recommendation Implementation Tracking Report on the next 3 pages)

The report is generated from the GCRTA Internal Audit Department audit management system (TeamMate). All outstanding issues and recommendations from internal and external audits and reviews are tracked within the application module (TeamCentral).

Audit staff is directed to follow-up with management to evaluate actions have been effectively implemented.

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

STATUS OF OUTSTANDING FOLLOW-UP

Recommendation Implementation Tracking

Recommendation	Project Code	Issue	Estimated Date	Actual Date	Owner	Entity
<u>Defect Reporting Process Overhaul</u>	2011-IA-01 - Rail PM Program/Ultramain Assessment	Defect Reporting - (Equipment Unit - West End)	6/30/2011		Thompson, Sean	
<u>Create Power & Way Stores</u>	2011-IA-01 - Rail PM Program/Ultramain Assessment	Power & Way - Stores	6/30/2011		Thompson, Sean	
<u>Re-locate Facility Maintenance Planners/Re-configure Plan</u>	2011-IA-01 - Rail PM Program/Ultramain Assessment	Rail District - Facility Maintenance Planners On-Site	6/30/2011		Thompson, Sean	
<u>Remove "Labor Used" Tab</u>	2011-IA-01 - Rail PM Program/Ultramain Assessment	Remove "Labor-Used" Tab	6/30/2011		Thompson, Sean	
<u>Install Dual Screens - Rail Equipment</u>	2011-IA-01 - Rail PM Program/Ultramain Assessment	Supervisor Screens	6/30/2011		Thompson, Sean	
<u>Implement Tool Check in/out Ultramain Feature</u>	2011-IA-01 - Rail PM Program/Ultramain Assessment	Tool Check Check in/out	6/30/2011		Thompson, Sean	
<u>Provide view access to CCTV and Consolidated Dispatch System</u>	2011-IA-01 - Rail PM Program/Ultramain Assessment	CCTV/Consolidated Train Dispatch View Access for the Equipment Shop	7/29/2011		Thompson, Sean	
<u>Unrecorded Parts Inventory Issuance</u>	2014 - SP - 07 - May 26, 2014 Railcar Derailment - Investigation	Unrecorded Parts Inventory Issuance	12/31/2014		Muti, Teresa	Rail District
<u>Reevaluate Change Card configurations</u>	2015 - RA - 03 - Farebox Change Cards	Change Cards have embedded transfers	12/31/2015		Lively, Michael	Revenue
<u>Tablet installation</u>	2015 - SP - 06 - Transit Police - 07/26/15 Incident Handling - Special Investigation	Standard equipment for all TP vehicles	12/31/2015		O'Neil, Sean	Transit Police

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

STATUS OF OUTSTANDING FOLLOW-UP

Recommendation Implementation Tracking

Recommendation	Project Code	Issue	Estimated Date	Actual Date	Owner	Entity
<u>Upgrade the Fare Collection System</u>	2015 - RA - 03 - Farebox Change Cards	GFI software outdated	1/31/2016		Lively, Michael	
<u>Employee Background Checks - Customer Service Center</u>	2016 - SP - 04 - Tower City Customer Service Center Investigation	Employee Background Check	4/29/2016		Jaszczak, Elizabeth	Customer Service Center
<u>Re-assign a Service Quality Supervisor to E.55th Yard and Station during Peak Service</u>	2015 - IA - 18 - Rail Yard Operations	Limited Rail Yard Control Supervision	5/31/2016		Mercer, Robert	Service Quality
<u>Develop Qualifications for Yardpersons</u>	2015 - IA - 18 - Rail Yard Operations	Missing Yardperson Test Results	5/31/2016		Thompson, Sean	Rail District
<u>Establish Dedicated Railyard Radio Communication Channel</u>	2015 - IA - 18 - Rail Yard Operations	Yard Radio Communication	5/31/2016		Caver, Ph. D., Floun'say	Service Quality
<u>Standards for Capturing and Reporting Mechanical and Facility Corrective Maintenance</u>	2015 - IA - 18 - Rail Yard Operations	Defect Reporting - Control Center	6/30/2016		Caver, Ph. D., Floun'say	Service Quality
<u>Evaluate and Revise Standard Process for Defect Reporting</u>	2015 - IA - 18 - Rail Yard Operations	Defect Reporting - Rail Cars	6/30/2016		Thompson, Sean	Rail District
<u>Use of Yardpersons to Operate Railcars in Revenue Service</u>	2015 - IA - 18 - Rail Yard Operations	Use of Yardpersons to Operate Railcars in Revenue Service	6/30/2016		Thompson, Sean	Rail District
<u>Point of Sale System - Cash Register</u>	2016 - SP - 04 - Tower City Customer Service Center Investigation	Point of Sale System - Cash Register	6/30/2016		Perez, Hilda	Customer Service Center
<u>Create Crew Chief Position</u>	2016 - SP - 01 - Railcar Cleaning	Closing Work Orders - Cleaning Railcars	8/31/2016		Blaze, Casey	Rail District

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

STATUS OF OUTSTANDING FOLLOW-UP
--

Recommendation Implementation Tracking

Recommendation	Project Code	Issue	Estimated Date	Actual Date	Owner	Entity
<u>Customer Service Center Facility and Equipment</u>	2016 - SP - 04 - Tower City Customer Service Center Investigation	Customer Service Center Facility and Equipment	8/31/2016		Perez, Hilda	Customer Service Center

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

OTHER PROJECTS

Fraud Hotline

The GCRTA Fraud Hotline (216) 350-5130 is established to reduce and recover the loss of public funds from any acts of fraud, waste and/or abuse. GCRTA contracts include contact information and require contractors to call whenever they suspect an illegal act or an ethics violation. The Hotline is available to our employees and the public. Audit Staff will work closely with Management, Transit Police as well as law enforcement agencies, prosecutors, professional associations and the public to ensure GCRTA assets are safeguarded.

Information Technology Steering Committee

The Chief Information Officer chairs this committee. The purpose of this committee is to oversee, analyze and prioritize the overall technology needs of the Authority.

Change Order Review Committee

The General Manager/CEO created this committee to review potential contract change orders greater than (50) thousand dollars to validate the appropriateness of the request and to ensure appropriate Procurement and Project Management processes are adhered to. Internal Audit serves as a resource to the committee.

First Quarter 2017 Change Orders:

- Board of Trustee Resolution - 2014-11:

Contract No. 2016-056 with Envirocom Construction Incorporated for Mayfield Road Streetscape Improvements

System Security Program Planning Committee

The Deputy General Manager of Operations created this committee. The purpose of this committee is to oversee, analyze, and prioritize the overall system security needs of the Authority. The Transit Police provide the agenda for the quarterly meetings.

TransitStat

The Executive Director of the Office of Management & Budget created this Program. The purpose of this Program is to provide management feedback and the resources to self-assess. The program is designed to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of management. Internal Audit serves as a panel member and a resource to management.

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

STAFF TRAINING

The following training was provided to Audit Staff during the First Quarter 2017:

Northeast Ohio Internal Audit Local Chapter

- **Construction and Vendor Risk Management**
- **Tax Risk Management**
- **Up Your Game – Managing Your Performance and Career Path**
- **Trusted Advisors: Key Attributes of Outstanding Internal Auditors**
- **Data Visualization**
- **Cybersecurity Risk**
- **IA Process and Testing & Department Struggles and Solutions**
- **Data Analytics**
- **Auditing Contracts and Construction Projects**
- **Dealing with Data Quality and Integrity**
- **Revenue Recognition**
- **Leveraging Data Analytics for Forensic Accounting Investigations**

Northeast Ohio Association of Certified Fraud Examiners

- **Financial Interviewing and Interrogation**
- **Technology Framework Gaps and their impact for potential fraud**
- **Ways to Locate Hidden Assets, Interests and Income**
- **Fraud Autopsies**
- **Inside Real-Life Fraud Cases**

Northeast Ohio Information Systems Audit and Control Association

- **Security Challenges with the Internet of Things**
- **Digital Investigations**
- **Data Loss Prevention: Protecting Sensitive Information Across the Environment**

GCRTA

- **State Safety Oversight Training – Integrated Command Center (ODOT)**
- **Purchasing Card Industry Training – PCI Compliance**
- **Environmental & Sustainability Management System Training**

**GREATER CLEVELAND REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY
INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT QUARTERLY REPORT
JANUARY 1, 2017 THROUGH MARCH 31, 2017**

STAFF PROFILES

Anthony A. Garofoli Executive Director of Internal Audit	Anthony joined the GCRTA on September 23, 1996. He earned his BBA in Accounting from Cleveland State University. Prior to joining the GCRTA, he worked 16 years in progressively responsible positions for the Office of the Auditor of the State of Ohio. His audit experience includes Financial Audits of State and Local Governmental Units, Fraud and Contract Compliance Audits. He has earned several certifications.
Anthony Ghanem Acting Senior Auditor	Anthony joined the GCRTA on June 4, 2012. He earned his BA in Economics and International Studies from Case Western Reserve University and his Master's Degree in Public Administration from Cleveland State University. He is a graduate of the GCRTA Management Development Program.
Bonson Yee Information Technology Auditor	Bonson joined the GCRTA on September 6, 2005. He earned his BBA in Accounting from Cleveland State University. Bonson is a Certified Information Systems Auditor.
Edward Gaio Staff Auditor	Ed joined the GCRTA on February 21, 2006. He earned his BA in Criminal Justice and a BBA in Finance from Kent State University. Edward is a Certified Fraud Examiner.
Maria Shurik Staff Auditor	Maria joined the GCRTA on June 1, 2014. She earned a BA in Urban Studies and her Master's Degree in Public Administration from Cleveland State University. She is a graduate of the GCRTA Management Development Program.
Staff Auditor	Vacant
Wali Shariff Business Analyst	Wali joined the GCRTA in February, 2016. He earned his BA from The Ohio State University and is currently working towards his Master's Degree in Public Administration at Cleveland State University.
Neletre Burts-Tolbert Secretary	Nell joined the GCRTA in 1990. In addition to her clerical and administrative responsibilities, she assists the Executive Director and Audit staff with a variety of specialized audit support services.